Existentialism and Vocal Instruction in Higher Education

Susan A. Boddie
Acadia University, Nova Scotia, Canada

Abstract

This study explores the source of inconsistent and unemotional performances by voice students in higher education music programs. The emphasis will be on how to address this through vocal instruction. Many varying approaches to vocal instruction exist in higher education programs which appear to prolong inconsistency and unengaged performing. The research explores several existentialist principles of Jean-Paul Sartre and how these principles may inform and enhance current vocal teaching practice in higher education and perhaps better prepare new voice teachers. The following study will consider the effectiveness of the application of Sartre's existentialist principles and how they may inform vocal instruction and improve vocal development.

Introduction

As a vocal performance undergraduate student, I was frequently frustrated and discouraged by the inconsistent quality of my singing, since often I sounded like a different person in weekly lessons and daily practice. Meribeth Bunch Dayme (2005) states, "Aesthetically, the most important aspect of the voice is resonance, which comes mainly from the pharynx, a part of the vocal tract" (p. 68). It is disconcerting for a singer to not be able to achieve a consistent resonant singing tone. I remained unaware of how to mitigate this inconsistency until I pursued a master's degree and studied with renowned vocal pedagogue Patricia Misslin. Her approach, while somewhat holistic, was more of a natural approach, which will be defined in the literature review. She attempted to instruct her students to sing independently. As part of a research study for her doctoral dissertation, Jenny Dufault (2008) examined the teaching philosophy of my former teacher. She surveyed the top percentage of metropolitan opera competition finalists and winners, researching and interviewing the three teachers who taught the majority of the winners. She observed that Misslin let the students find their own sound. She did not address tension or registers in the voice; instead, she used an approach of rhythm and movement and a positive learning environment in her lessons to help students discover their sound, and she focused on the feeling and experience of each voice. This is how Misslin instructed me while I studied at the Manhattan School of Music in New York City.

As I began my own teaching career and throughout many years of teaching, I utilized some of the ideas instilled in me by Misslin. However, I also explored the idea of instructing using an even more holistic singing approach that addresses the complete singer and views the student as an individual. The terms "holistic" and "wholistic" are often used interchangeably. For the purpose of this research study, the term "holistic" as it applies to education will be utilized. A holistic approach to education is one that aims to develop the emotional, spiritual, moral and psychological elements of the student, including the experience (Miller, 2007). In my daily teaching practice, I aid students in discovering their individual sound, breath support, and tension-free singing, striving to foster artistic performances by freeing students of the restrictions they often feel when unable to sing consistently. I attempt to instill responsibility and accountability in my students and expect them to take an active role in building technique and ownership of their voices.

There are parallels to Misslin's and my teaching approach to those of Jean-Paul Sartre's philosophical tenets that are central to existentialist thinking. As I began to explore existentialist principles, I was drawn in particular to Sartre and his ideas based in freedom and responsibility, and I considered to what extent they could be applied to vocal instruction. For this study, Sartre's principle of freedom will be considered in relation to the exploration of a teacher's freedom to become the type of teacher she[i] chooses utilizing a varied teaching skill set. As well, the teacher's freedom to find her essence as a facilitator in the voice studio will be explored. Freedom will also be considered as student's free will and choice, and what she can become as a singer. Freedom will also be explored in terms of artistic choices in performance. Moreover, freedom in singing will be considered as it applies to tension-free singing. Sartre's principle of responsibility for this study is considered as the responsibility a voice teacher has as the facilitator in the student-teacher relationship. It will also be explored as the ownership a student has in vocal study. The student is responsible for her outcome; the idea of "no excuses" according to Sartre (1984) will be developed.

Sartre had an appreciation and love for music. It played an important role in his life, was part of his family, and remained throughout his life. His ideas on music and emotion in *Situations* (1965) resonated with me as a musician. He speaks of music, and freedom, and how music expresses and evokes emotion. It expresses the emotions of an age and may express the emotions of the oppressed or their hopes of a future. Sartre found solace, emotion, and freedom in music (Noudelmann, 2012). He played the piano daily, even later in his life when he lost his eyesight. Sartre (2001) includes the following statement:

> Sartre says of music it will always be over and above anything you can say about it. No matter how thorough the attempt to characterize in words what is expressed in music something remains uncaptured. Music says more than we can say that it says. (p. 289)

I was drawn to Sartre's appreciation of music as a musician; however, as I explored his central themes of freedom and responsibility and those ideas that stem from them (existence, essence, abandonment, and anguish), I thought it would be beneficial to consider the ways in which Sartre's theory could inform voice teaching practice. This rationale will be further clarified in my theoretical framework.

Problem Statement

Inconsistent and emotionally unengaged singing by voice students is widespread, particularly in many university programs and in inexperienced singers. This was my experience as an undergraduate student, when I studied with many teachers who were not able to help me solve the problem of inconsistency. The source of the problem is perhaps a lack of voice teacher preparation as well as ambiguous approaches to vocal instruction in higher education. As I engaged in a preliminary literature review of vocal pedagogy degree programs and philosophies of vocal instruction to frame the discussion of inconsistent and unemotional singing, I discovered there are many different teaching approaches that may further such inconsistencies. These will be discussed in more detail in my literature review.

Many students I have observed on voice jury panels, in lessons, performances, recitals and competitions exhibit technical deficiencies and inconsistencies such as poor posture, lack of consistent breath support, the inability to balance resonance throughout their vocal range, a habit of pushing the voice, and unemotional performances. Smith and Chipman (2007) write, "It is common for singers to 'phone in' performances- not 'being in the moment' of their performance

or creating something fresh and new" (p. 23). Emotions generated by the performer and audience members in a performing art such as singing are created in the present - at the moment it is being created - as opposed to other creative arts such as writing or painting. The reaction to these other art forms is generated after their creation. This immediacy of creation is why it is so essential for a singer to be emotionally engaged in performance. They further explain that "because singing must be constantly created in the moment, we must have a technique for it that moves through time as well" (p. 23). At the time of performance, the singer must explore her artistic freedom and not focus on, or be distracted by, technique. Technical deficiencies will prolong the inability to emotionally connect to music. Joan Patenaude-Yarnell (2004) also notes the technical deficiencies and adds that many students also display the inability to sing *fioratura*[ii] and lack the ability to sing *legato.* [iii]

   A study examining the vocal mechanics of untrained singers (an untrained singer in the study is a student with fewer than two years of training) identifies complaints and inconsistencies in technique from students. Complaints such as hoarseness, breathiness in tone (lack of resonance or ring in the sound), laryngeal tension, and decreased range are identified as predominant problems for inexperienced singers. Teachey, Kahane and Beckford (1991) discuss how "lacking sufficient formal vocal training, the untrained or minimally trained singer has a poor understanding of the capacities and limitations of the vocal mechanism" (p. 55). The researchers find a high incidence of vocal lesions in inexperienced singers. Inconsistent singing or misuse can lead to fatigue and other more serious issues. Tammy Frederick observes that "the number one cause of hoarseness and vocal fatigue is poor vocal technique" (2006, p. 32). A singer who does not have an awareness of how his or her voice functions has poor technique. This causes the singer to try to force a sound from the vocal folds without engaging any of the resonators in the body designed for amplifying the voice such as the neck, skull, sinuses, chest, and vocal tract. Frederick explains further: "If you find you get hoarse after performing or rehearsing it is very likely that you are singing with a high larynx. To make matters worse, you are probably forcing large amounts of air through this high larynx by shouting or singing loudly" (p. 32). When this occurs, one has tension in the throat and fatigue will set in. Many of these common vocal complaints and inconsistencies have been identified by researchers (Sataloff, 1998). An individual singing without technical consistency will experience a great deal of fatigue or swelling in the vocal folds.

   Some higher education vocal pedagogy programs have teaching practicum courses,[iv] in which a student teaches another student and is supervised; however, there appear to be no courses or parts of voice pedagogy textbooks that address the relationship of the teacher and student and the important consequences of how a student is taught (Alderson, 1979; Bunch, 1997, 2005; Deere, 2005; Doscher, 1994; Hines, 1982; McKinney, 2005; Miller,1986, Sataloff, 1998; Vennard, 1967; Ware, 1998; Whitlock, 1975). Not addressing these important consequences can further inconsistent and unengaged singing, as teachers will not know how to relay information to students. It is not indicated how much supervision and mentoring takes place in these programs.[v] In examining voice pedagogy classes at her institute, Patti Peterson (2004) realized that supervision and mentoring of voice students is actually quite limited. Graduate students may receive mentoring for just several days per term and the hope is that the void in guidance will be filled by one or two basic pedagogy courses. This may further the problem of inconsistent singing. Not only are pedagogy programs focusing on the science of singing, it appears that there is limited mentoring and supervision of pre-service teachers. [vi] It is important to understand the anatomy of the voice, the breath mechanism, phonation, and articulation in order to learn and

instruct the technique of singing; however, this does not help the student obtain consistent vocal technique if the teacher-student relationship does not translate this information holistically.

This is an educational problem. It is my intention to explore the relationship of the teacher and student and to propose an open-ended pedagogical method that may help the student find vocal consistency and artistic freedom. More specifically, the higher education problem to address is that this inconsistency and lack of engagement stems from a teaching problem. This study offers ways to consider and to make recommendations for vocal instruction. Addressing the student-teacher relationship in the voice studio and applying existentialist principles such as freedom and responsibility may result in a relationship that aids consistent and emotionally engaged singing in higher education. This study may encourage better curriculum design in vocal pedagogy programs as well as more self-awareness in current voice practitioners. A student who is instructed by a teacher with a varied skill set may become aware of her freedom. In so doing the teacher also the opportunity to explore her own freedom to become the type of instructor she wishes to be.

Many current vocal pedagogy degree programs, textbooks, and research projects are lacking the important element of the teacher-student relationship with the teacher as facilitator. Pamela Wurgler (1997) poses the question:

> Why do most fledging voice teachers spend their first few years of teaching "reinventing the wheel?" Why do most teach as they were taught, not as they were taught to teach? It is possible that they were not taught *how* to teach? (p. 3)

These contrasting views on instructing singers emphasize just one aspect of the singer and appear ambiguous and underdeveloped. They do not take the entire singer into consideration and, thus, may contribute to the problem of inconsistency. Existentialism offers an interesting way to reconceptualise the view of vocal instruction and may result in more consistent and emotional singing. For this reason, part of the research will also attend to re-engaging students' experience of joy in singing, as well as keeping this important live art form relevant in a culture where so much is manufactured and created artificially. A teacher can guide this passion, encourage, and motivate the student.

Statement of Purpose

This study draws upon Jean-Paul Sartre's central existentialist principles of freedom and responsibility, and upon those that stem from them: namely existence, essence, responsibility, and freedom (facticity, abandonment, and anguish). It discusses these as they apply to and may inform and enhance current vocal pedagogy practice, specifically in fostering consistent and emotionally engaged singing in voice students. These terms will be defined in more detail in the overview of Sartre's existentialism later in this paper. Sartre states (1993), "Existentialism's first move is to make every man aware of what he is and to make the full responsibility of his existence rest on him" (p. 36). This statement exemplifies the research. This research study will examine a pedagogical method of vocal instruction informed by Sartre's existentialist principles of freedom and responsibility in order to consider the extent to which it facilitates consistent and engaged singing. This research has potential impact upon vocal instruction at the higher education level and in vocal pedagogy degree programs. While I will include a review of other existential educational researchers, the primary influence of the study will be Sartre and his central tenets of freedom and responsibility.

Research Question

This study will consider the application of vocal instruction at the higher education level by drawing upon existentialist principles in order to facilitate consistent and emotionally engaged singing. Specifically, in drawing upon the principles of existentialism, my aim is to refocus current vocal pedagogical practices by taking into consideration the relationship of the teacher and student, with the teacher as a facilitator in vocal study. The central guiding principle of a teaching method influenced by existentialism is to view the student as an individual, instructing and guiding him or her to be responsible for learning while helping the student to find individual freedom. Thus, the central question that guides this study is:

> To what extent can Jean-Paul Sartre's existentialist principles of responsibility and freedom suitably influence the student-teacher relationship and be applied to vocal development to improve inconsistent and emotionally unengaged singing in undergraduate music students?

Significance of the Research

The research study will be of significance to those in the field of vocal instruction and vocal pedagogy degree programs. Many teaching philosophies currently used in higher education institutions appear to have significant ambiguity, as I will discuss in the literature review. The study will explore the use of a varied set of teaching tools that may help foster consistent and emotionally engaged performances in students studying voice and may help them gain responsibility in the learning process as well as find freedom in performance and expression. If successful, the tenets studied may be considered by teachers currently instructing in higher education. As well, the study may offer students in vocal pedagogy degree programs a method to use when they begin to instruct.

The application of the existentialist principles of Jean-Paul Sartre and other existentialist philosophers has been considered in relation to general education, and the use of arts in the classroom. A method of piano instruction at the higher education level that uses existentialist principles has already been explored (Mortyakova, 2009); however, there has been no significant research in vocal instruction and the influence of existentialist principles. This study presents the field of the philosophy of education and vocal instruction with new research that may prompt discussion and debate in pedagogical approaches to vocal instruction. This debate may result in a refocus or may encourage current vocal instructors to reflect on their methodologies. This can be beneficial to students. An instructor who is willing to reflect and to explore his or her own freedom in how he or she instructs consequently may help students engaged in vocal study explore their freedom and reach a higher level of performance.

The problem of inconsistent and emotionally unengaged singing has been identified. The aim is to research and attempt to offer ways to help mitigate this problem, which stems from teaching. In order to understand how this problem originates as a teaching problem, it is important to explore various methods of vocal instruction in order to examine where there are inconsistencies in tenets as well as much ambiguity.

Pedagogical Approaches in Higher Education Institutions

There are conflicting approaches as well as inherent difficulties in describing vocal instruction. As will be discussed in this section, various approaches to teaching exist. Approaches for vocal instruction may be those based in science and anatomy, those based in imagery and visualization, a natural approach, a holistic approach, or other approaches considered contemporary, in that they have been created in the past fifty years. Some teachers may attempt to instruct with an overlap of several styles or adhere to just one method.

It is a challenge to describe a standardised approach to vocal instruction. Fields (1947) outlined several difficulties that illustrate how a standardized approach is relatively impossible to describe. He described difficulties such as the subjective nature of singing. Singing involves self-analysis as well as analysis by the instructor, and both singer and instructor may have a different opinion of what he or she hears. Another difficulty noted is that many authorities on voice and vocal instruction disagree. This will be evident in the sections describing various national approaches as well as overarching teaching tenets in higher education music institutions. Additionally, there is a lack of standards for, and regulation of, voice teaching. One does not find a standardized board exam or other ways of certifying the depth and breadth of knowledge of voice teachers, as is found in other professions. Many voice teachers use an individual method without testing it empirically for success or failure, and simply continue to teach using the same approach. Some voice instructors at the higher education level may engage in active performing careers or have a substantial list of performance credits on their curricula vitae; however, these individuals may not be able to facilitate the acquisition of technique and artistry for their students.

This confusion, conflict, and variation in approaches present a challenge to the student trying to navigate the process of finding his or her vocal sound and building a technique that will result in artistic performances.

The various pedagogical approaches to instructing voice in North American institutions are not considered part of a national school of thought. This is due to the concept that many teachers based in North American institutions come from various backgrounds and teaching traditions that have been blended with new traditions in North America (Blades-Zeller, 2003). This is in direct contrast to the western European national schools of thought, in which teachers adhere to national pedagogical tenets when instructing voice students. Much of the pedagogical tradition in North American institutions stems from the Italian tradition (Blades-Zeller, 2003; Clements, 2008; Deere, 2002; Dufault, 2008; Miller 1977, 1997; Stark, 1999; Sell, 2005; Taylor 1922). Influences from several national schools are found in North America. The English and German choral traditions are represented in Canada and the United States. As well "there exists an open rivalry in some regions of Canada between the Italian and the German techniques" (Miller, 1997, p. 202).

A group of voice instructors from higher education institutions in the United States were surveyed as to whether or not they felt there is an American vocal sound or school of thought (Blades-Zeller, 2003). Teachers surveyed indicated that no American national school of singing exists, describing an American sound or voice stamp as "natural," "fresh," "versatile," "non-mannered," or "Italianate style" (pp. 185 and 187). Only one teacher surveyed felt there is an American sound, which she described as forward and bright. Barbara Doscher (in Blades-Zeller, 2003) states, "The best American-trained singer uses the traditional Italian or bel canto method" (p. 190). Several teachers described the German sound quite negatively: Shirlee Emmons

indicates, "Germans do a lot of barking" (p. 186), while Helen Hodam described the German sound as "narrow" (p. 188). Several instructors surveyed described their method of instruction in institutions as being influenced by Italian or German techniques.

There are numerous pedagogical approaches to teaching voice. For instance, terms such as a "mechanistic approach" were more prominent in the early 20th century; however this approach lacks the physiological aspect and use of technology found in today's scientific approach to teaching (Deere, 2002; Fields, 1947).

Notions of vocal instruction can be classified as: mechanistic (technical, scientific), poetic (imagery based teaching), psychological (historically referred to as visual or based in imagery), demonstrative (rote teaching), empirical (experimental teaching while rejecting vocal science), phonetic (training the singer as one would speak), progressive (using vocal literature as a teaching tool), inspirational (imprinting behavior from teacher to student; parallels demonstrative), holistic (attempting to unify all aspects of the singer), natural (the "do-nothing" approach), technical (similar to mechanistic), technically intense (mechanistic), interpretation-oriented (avoiding technical aspects and studying literature; similar to progressive and natural approaches), the technique-mystique teacher (imagery; parallels poetic), the one-aspect teacher (teacher focused on one part of singing exclusive of other aspects), meditation (meditation as a means to remove tensions), and removing muscular interferences (tension-free singing; parallels natural, meditation, and phonetic approaches) (Bruser, 2011; Clements, 2008; Dufault, 2008; Deere, 2002; Elliot, 2010; Fields, 1947; Gregg, 2001; Miller, 1986; Nelson & Blades, 2005; Samoiloff, 1942; Stark, 1999). Additionally, in current vocal instruction, pedagogical methods such as Speech Level Singing™ (2013), Estill Voice Training™ (2013), Somatic Voicework™, The LoVetri Method (2013), the International Voice Teachers of Mix (2013), and the Feldenkrais Method® (2013) exist. For the purpose of review for this research study, several commonly used approaches for vocal instruction in higher education institutions will be selected. The approaches that will be reviewed are those based in vocal science and anatomy, imagery and imagination, and a natural approach. Some similar and distinguishing characteristics will be presented.

Vocal Science and Anatomy

The first pedagogical approach that will be examined is a method based in the use of vocal science and anatomy as the foundation for instruction. This method involves the use of explanations of how the vocal mechanism functions and knowledge of the anatomy of the vocal mechanism. The first teacher credited with using a scientific approach to vocal instruction is Manuel Garcia (1835). Garcia was the teacher first credited with a more scientific approach to vocal pedagogy and with the development of the *laryngoscope* (an instrument which allows one to see the vocal folds and glottis), which is significant for maintaining vocal health (Clements, 2008; Deere, 2002; Reid, 1972; Stark, 1999; Ware, 1998). David (1995) writes of the change of focus in vocal instruction, indicating that, historically, "voice teachers have remained happily uniformed about the workings of the larynx and vocal tract" (p. xi). Garcia took a more scientific look at the vocal mechanism and its function: "When Garcia invented his laryngoscope, new curiosities were aroused as to the probable nature of the vocal function and its mechanics" (Reid, 1972, p. 3). Many teachers reacted against this more scientific approach (Clements, 2008).

There are teaching methodologies influenced by the science and physiology of singing currently used in some higher education institutions in North America. "A new voice pedagogy is emerging which is based on an understanding of the structure and function of the vocal and

respiratory tracts" (David, 1995, p. xii). The conceptual underpinning of a methodology based in vocal science is the premise that a voice teacher who has knowledge of how the voice functions will teach in a way that promotes vocal health and longevity in singing. Some teachers use technological tools such as a voice spectrograph or other software- based programs to aid in a visual representation of the voice. These tools will be discussed in further detail. A scientific teaching approach based on the physiology and anatomy of the vocal mechanism is a preventative method. Its central tenets surround vocal health and avoidance of abuse, as well as the identification of vocal problems. David notes that "knowledge has evolved into a systematic understanding of proper voice use in order to avoid laryngeal damage before it happens" (p. xii). Voice professors who instruct at higher education institutions have increased scientific awareness of the physiological aspects of singing and how tone is produced (Alderson, 1979; Appelman, 1974; Bunch, 1997, Doscher, 1994; McKinney, 1994; Ware, 1998).

Certain prominent higher education music institutes [vii] and well- known vocal pedagogues promote the usage of vocal science as part of their teaching curriculum (Miller, 1977, 1986, 1997, 2004; Blades-Zeller, 2003; Bunch, 1997; Doscher, 1994; McKinney, 1994; McPherson, 2002; Sataloff, 1998).

The implementation of technology such as a voice spectrograph in the voice studio is considered a potentially important addition to vocal instruction (Barnes-Burrow et al., 2008; Callaghan & Wilson, 2004; Miller, 2008; Titze, 1986). Titze (1994) indicates, "If we believe the statement that singing is vocal athletics, we could perhaps benefit from experiences that the field of athletics has had with high technology" (p. 276). Titze sees technology as a way to chart changes in student progress and as a way to address vocal health issues as soon they occur. As well, he sees technology in the voice studio as a way to increase efficiency in singing as well as to move towards a standardized approach to instructing singing.

Some voice instructors indicate their use of technology as a teaching aid. It is used to offer instant feedback and assessment to the teacher and student. Glaros (2006), for example, details numerous technological tools she uses as teaching aids. She lists recording devices such as digital recorders and CD burners to record lessons, the use of Webcams for visual feedback, and a computer to show students videos of songs they are studying. As well, she discusses music software that scans music to a computer and plays digital vocal accompaniment tracks, such as SmartMusic® and Finale®. The SmartMusic® program plays vocal accompaniment tracks and has the ability to alter tempo (speed). It also has a recording function, whereby the student can record her practice session of a particular song for playback. There are other software programs that offer auto-accompanying and some vocal anthologies come with karaoke accompaniment CDs. These may be of benefit while learning a new song or they may help the student internalise the piano accompaniment for a song; however, it does seem more beneficial for the teacher and/or accompanist to work in person with the student to find the most individualised interpretation of a song. Each student must find a fitting tempo, and the unique interpretation of a song text and melodic line cannot be practiced independently by a student using an accompaniment CD. The student will inevitably follow along with the CD and will not set her own tempo. If the student continues to use a karaoke CD, this interpretation as well as tempo is what will be set in the muscle memory of the student in the practice room. As well, the collaborative relationship of the singer and pianist is an artistic interaction that cannot be replicated by a technological tool.

Glaros (2006) believes this software program is quite valuable in its ability to record the student singing pre-set vocal exercises. The student sings vocal exercises that are part of the

software program. They are recorded and the assessment given to the student entails noting accuracy or errors in pitch and rhythm. These files can be saved and emailed to the vocal instructor.

Though it is quite important for a student to learn the pitches and rhythms of a song or vocal exercise accurately, this software program will not help facilitate consistent vocal technique, and thus may not improve the ability to sing artistically. This use of technology may help the singer consistently sing in tune and be aware of rhythm; however, it will not aid the student in mitigating the challenge of finding a consistent resonant singing tone. An instructional method utilizing a software program such as this one, with assessment tools for pitch and rhythm as well as pre-determined vocal exercises, does not address the singer as an individual. Each student may not benefit from the same exercises, as each student may have different issues to address. No one singer is the same as another or has the same areas of vocal development to work on. Pre-determined exercises may not address specific needs and may not foster consistent singing. The student who is instructed with a method incorporating such software will be encouraged to focus on accurate rhythm and pitch. This may not facilitate consistency in singing and will not likely foster artistry. If a student is instructed to primarily focus on rhythm and pitch, it is apparent that there is not much focus on expressiveness and an emotional connection to the music and text. As well, vocal instructors should tailor individual exercises for their students based on what issues must be addressed. Instant assessment and a flexible approach must be used. This cannot be accomplished if a student emails a set of vocal exercises to the voice instructor.

Some voice instructors at higher education institutions state that knowledge of vocal science is part of an outstanding teacher skill set. A female instructor interviewed (2009) writes, "It is imperative to recognise that knowledge of the voice mechanism and its foundation of objective pedagogy. A mastery of these concepts is prerequisite for artistic expression" (p. 106). One of the female instructors surveyed (in Blades-Zeller, 2003) states, "By far at the head of the list, is to know your field. Know how the voice functions" (p. 221). Another indicates, "Number one is the ability to diagnose a voice and diagnose vocal faults" (p. 222). One of the male instructors states, "An outstanding teacher has knowledge of the voice, the mechanism and how it works" (p. 223). As well, a female instructor states an attribute as "knowledge of the instrument, technical and in regard to repertoire," and another indicates that "we must have a knowledge of voice structure and function and how it all works together" (p. 224). Additionally, one of the male instructors states, "In our day and age, it's important for a teacher to have a solid knowledge of the anatomy and physiology of the voice" (p. 227). These instructors at higher education institutions consider knowledge of the anatomy of the voice and how it functions as an important part of higher education vocal instruction. It is of great value to a voice instructor to have knowledge of how the vocal mechanism functions. It gives the instructor the opportunity to explain the function of singing in a logical manner to the student. This can be aided with the use of anatomy diagrams. Singing is a blind activity. Singers do not have the opportunity to see how a note is emitted, as is possible for a pianist or cellist, for example. A voice teacher with the ability and capacity to illustrate how a note is phonated by the vocal mechanism, how the breath functions, as well as where the voice resonates in the body may help to foster consistent singing. This teacher will have the ability to give credible and relevant information to a student that a student can think about while practising between lessons. This information must, however, be executed while working with the student on artistic interpretation as well; otherwise, the instruction will be compartmentalised and will not address the entire singer.

Another method claimed to be a scientific approach is called the Vocal Science™ Method (2013). Proponents of this method claim it is able to promote accelerated vocal development. The Royans School of Vocal Science (2013) guarantees that students will acquire the ability to sing at a professional level in ten hours or less. The method is described as a holistic method, because the body is viewed as the instrument and the singing voice is a reflection of the inner self. The mechanics of the teaching method incorporate repetitive exercises and visualization to help achieve proper vocal placement and to help pitch. It incorporates elements of posture and the use of facial and abdominal muscles. As well, the method employs the use of a PA system, keyboard, video camera, and microphone.

This particular method appears quite ambiguous and confusing. The method is called "vocal science," which would indicate instruction based in vocal anatomy and the mechanics of singing as one finds in a higher education vocal pedagogy course. The method also claims to be holistic and indicates that the body is the instrument. The resonating chambers of the face, skull, and vocal tract are where natural vocal resonance takes place. If this method is holistic—whereby the body is the instrument— it is not clear why the method uses a microphone and PA system. Artificial amplification of the voice is not a holistic approach, and it is not using the body as an instrument capable of natural acoustics and amplification. The method also uses posture as part of the teaching practice. As will be discussed in the review of a natural approach to vocal instruction, posture and alignment are part of a natural method. This method also incorporates the use of visualization, which is part of a methodology based in imagery and imagination, but not vocal science. A voice teacher should have the ability to draw from a varied skill set; however, this method appears ambiguous. The use of repetitive exercises, as well as the use of artificial amplification, may not help a student find her individual resonant singing tone or consistency in singing. Moreover, it does not appear to indicate how it may foster artistic and emotionally engaged singing.

Vocal science combined with the use of technology has been considered in some institutions as a way to assist students in certain technical aspects, such as finding a resonant singing tone and breath support. Rebecca Folsom (2011) suggests that it is necessary to divide what she considers the five parts of the physiology of singing—"the neurological utility, breathing, laryngeal function, resonance/vocal tract and articulation"—into separate components, instructing students about each facet individually to ensure students understand each component of the vocal mechanism (p. 404). This approach may be too compartmentalised and might leave a student with no concept of a complete singer: person, body, mind, and soul.

Other instructors feel that a beneficial way to prepare new voice teachers is to ensure that they have studied a great deal of anatomy. Amanda Brunk (2008), for example, feels voice pedagogy students and those wishing to instruct voice should study vocal science. According to Brunk:

> The ideal situation would be that this new teacher has studied anatomy, physiology, and voice disorders pertinent to the function of the vocal mechanism and the body as an instrument. (p. 617)

Brunk's (2008) opinion as to how to prepare teachers in vocal pedagogy degree programs is that they should work in voice laboratories with acoustic analysis machines. She indicates several Canadian higher education institutions that offer one course in vocal pedagogy (study of vocal anatomy, and the physiology of the singing voice and how it functions). She expresses concern over the lack of vocal science study in many Canadian institutions, where students are "at a significant disadvantage for understanding the importance of voice science in today's teaching" (p. 616). She summarises her thoughts on the responsibility of a teacher to be one who

has knowledge of the anatomy of the voice and can identify vocal health problems. She appears critical both of teachers with excellent artistic ability and a great many performing credits in their career and of teachers who do not have a strong foundation in vocal science and anatomy. Brunk's opinion suggests that she values scientific knowledge as more of an asset to instruction than the ability to demonstrate and facilitate artistic interpretation. Knowledge of vocal anatomy is beneficial for teachers; however, the relationship between the student and teacher is an important element and it is beneficial to prepare students to translate knowledge of vocal science as well as to facilitate artistic singing. There must be a balance in place.

Some higher education music schools have used technical tools as part of their pedagogy with the particular use of video voice lessons. Eberle (2003) feels that this form of technology will give distance students an opportunity to be part of a larger music community, as "video conferencing and web-based instruction will enrich our students' performance and creative work" (p. 244). She states further that "these supplemental educational tools can indeed enhance the teaching of voice" (p. 245). Though web-based instruction has value in many educational settings, the relationship in the voice studio between teacher and student, with teacher as facilitator, is a relationship based in personal interaction and trust that may lose some effectiveness with a technological barrier. As well, some instructors use a "hands on" approach while teaching breath support, for example. It may be necessary for a teacher to place his or her hands on the rib cage of the student to guide the student as to where to breathe. This cannot be accomplished via web-based lessons.

Technical tools that provide a visual aid to measure accuracy in pitch, resonance, and rate of vibrato have been considered a useful teaching aid. Callaghan and Wilson (2004) indicate, "Many studies have shown that feedback is an essential part of learning psychomotor skills and, since more than sixty percent of the population are visual learners, visual feedback is particularly effective " (p. 1). Callaghan and Wilson (2004) developed a software program to assist voice teachers in the instruction of technical elements such as pitch, breath management, proper phonation (production of clear vocal tone without breath in the sound), and resonance. The program is designed to provide sequential exercises with feedback from a computer as a visual aid. The teacher is to follow the program as indicated in the manual. A typical scientific approach to voice pedagogy may consist of pre-planned lessons and predetermined goals. Wurgler (1997) writes:

> Pre-service teachers write innumerable lesson plans in their education course to practice writing goals, finding appropriate materials, and translating goals and materials into sequential steps. Often the written plan includes preplanned key questions, readiness activities, optional teaching strategies and even scripted steps (what a teacher plans to say at each step). (p. 3)

This sequential framework provides little support for a teacher in finding the student's individual sound. The emphasis in this style of teaching is a form of repetitive teaching, without much flexibility. A teacher who has a set lesson plan or follows a manual with scripted steps for voice students limits the opportunities for the student to think for herself, since "the teacher must help the student make connections" (p. 5). If a teacher is not equipped with a way to help the student find her individual sound or consistent technique and merely has her repeating multiple vocal exercises without relevance, the student will be confused and likely discouraged. This methodology may have a result similar to the computer-based software programs that present sequential exercises showing errors in pitch and rhythm, but offer little to foster technical consistency or expressive singing.

Additional researchers such as Scherer et al. (1994) indicate the positive effect they believe technology may have as a teaching tool for voice:

> Imagine the increased power of our teaching tools if we could identify and utilize the physiological nuances of vocal function responsible for communicating most effectively such emotions as scorn or sadness, mirth or happiness, in our professional and sometimes not so professional voice students. (p. 361)

This group of voice teachers, speech pathologists, and scientists discussed the effects of implementing more science and technology in working with the voice. Discussion group member and voice instructor Rubin states, "I can more readily identify vocal misuse, abuse, and disorders" (Scherer et al., 1994, p. 365). Howell indicates, "We teachers need the help of the laryngologists and the speech pathologists and the scientists who continue to define our terminology" (p. 371). Much of the study revolves around vocal health and maintenance, better teaching terminology, more accurate measurement of registers, vibrato, and resonance. There is, however, no indication of the positive effect on artistic singing.

Other studies have been conducted by researchers measuring how much use of technology is present in the voice studio. Barnes-Burroughs, Lan, Edwards, Noe, and Archambeault (2008) surveyed voice instructors in the United States regarding their use of and attitudes towards technology in the teaching studio. Teachers were questioned on their usage of several forms of technology, such as pitch-matching software, vocal methods and technique software, sound recording software, and music teaching computer software. Of the 52 teachers who responded to the survey, twenty-four were instructors in higher education institutions. A range of 80% to 98% of the total number of teachers surveyed indicated having no experience with the use of technology in the voice studio. It is interesting to note that this does indicate that there are some higher education teachers using some form of computer software as a teaching aid in their studios.

Tools such as voice spectrographs can be used in a pedagogical approach based in science and anatomy. The use of spectrographs offers a means of instant assessment to a teacher and singer during a lesson. The concept of resonance, considered in a scientific approach to pedagogy, can be instructed using a microphone placed at the lips of the singer. Acoustic resonance can be measured with a visual representation instantly available on screen to assess the frequency of the sound. This method is considered a teaching tool as well as a method of assessment for both the student and the instructor. It adds a level of real-time feedback and data collection, and it measures resonance. A student can relate the feeling of resonating to a visual tool to validate this sensation during a lesson. Epps, Smith and Wolfe (1997) performed a study measuring acoustic resonance in the vocal tract for the speaking voice using a non-invasive method of measurement for male and female voices. The vocal folds send an excitement signal through the vocal tract, which is measured by placing a microphone in front of the singer's mouth to pick up the frequency emitted.

A study by Joliveau, Smith, and Wolfe (2004) continued this method of measuring resonance in singers by engaging in a study measuring the acoustic resonance of a soprano. In this experiment, a microphone was placed at the mouth of the singer. Diagram 1 shows how acoustic resonance was measured in a non-invasive manner. An example of an invasive test of acoustic resonance is to have a singer lean into a megaphone type apparatus and attempt to sing in a natural manner. Leaning to sing into a megaphone type of apparatus will cause the singer to have her neck out of alignment, thus changing the shape of the vocal tract and affecting resonance.

The following example illustrates a way to measure resonance in which the singer can maintain posture conducive to good singing.

Diagram 1.

(Joliveau et al. 2004, p. 2435)

The measurement of frequency and the visual image of a graph represent the amount of resonance emitted by the singer. The use of such technological tools can be beneficial in building consistency in singing when used in a lesson with both teacher and student present. The student has the opportunity to connect a sensation of resonance with visual feedback indicating if the tone is emitting a frequency that falls within the range of "ring." This range occurs between 2000-3000Hz. A singer whose voice resonates in this range has the ability to be heard above an orchestra without amplification (Sundberg, 1977).

Some teachers in higher education institutions agree that a certain amount of knowledge of vocal science and anatomy is beneficial. Higher education voice instructor Helding (2012), indicates, "As an organization of voice professionals, we should likewise be grateful that there are those among us who are called to understand the construction of the vocal fold at the cellular level" (p. 67). Simonson (2012) reviews newer research topics in the field of voice for the past few years. Much research in higher education music departments is surrounding the use of science and technology in the voice studio. Topics have included measuring vocal registers using software programs, acoustical analysis of the tenor voice, and analysis of the voice for speaking versus singing. In the *Journal of Singing,* a new category has been present in past years entitled "Voice Research and Technology" (Titze, 2011). This represents the idea that knowledge of science and anatomy, as well the use of technology, is becoming more mainstream in vocal instruction.

Other researchers, such as Kirkpatrick, a higher education voice instructor, and McLester, an exercise physiologist (2012), studied and implemented the use of EMG (electromyographic) feedback to instruct singers to sing with a low laryngeal position.

In an article reviewing the past twenty-five years of vocal instruction, Cleveland (1994) tracked changes in certain technical aspects of singing, including views on resonance, registers, vibrato, and voice classification. He also reviewed what he considered the most important technological developments, such as spectrograph analysis for real-time viewing of vocal function. He summarised by stating the most significant change in twenty-five years: "We have seen a divided community of teachers, researchers, medical doctors, and speech-language pathologists, people who once worked in total isolation, realize their common interests can be better served by uniting and teaching and learning from each other" (p. 23). He writes of the collaboration between voice professionals and scientists as the possibility of "a gigantic technological transfer of information and knowledge from laboratory to the teaching studio, and a transfer of instrumental technology to assist in the studio" (p. 23). Perhaps a positive outcome

to be considered from a pedagogy based in science is an increased awareness by the student and pedagogue of vocal health and the prevention of vocal damage. Visual feedback on certain technical aspects of singing is also beneficial; however, this does not advance artistic singing or interpretation and emphasises just one aspect of singing.

Some concern has been expressed by voice teachers that the focus of voice pedagogy has been based solely on the physiology of singing. Denes Striny (2007, 2011) discusses his worry about the nature of voice pedagogy and its focus on the science and physiology of singing with little emphasis on ease of tone production. He expresses his fear that students will have a hard time finding a competent teacher. Miller (1986) states, "American vocal pedagogy has become a body with two heads, one speaking with the voice of the subjective teacher, the other with the voice of the science-oriented teacher" (p. 209).

It is apparent that a pedagogy based solely in science may consider just one aspect of voice student instruction without addressing other important aspects, such as artistic interpretation of music or the opportunity for voice teachers in higher education institutions to give students individualised attention. It is beneficial for the voice instructor to be able to translate clear and concise explanations of how the voice functions to his or her students. This may aid in fostering consistent singing for the student during practice sessions between voice lessons. If the student knows how the voice functions, he or she can approach studying the technique of singing well versed in how the vocal mechanism works. This must be combined, however, with an artistic interpretation of text.

The use of technological tools can be helpful as a means of instant feedback when used in the voice studio during a lesson. The instructor can help the student make the connections of a physical awareness of sound to visual feedback. This may, however, only be successful during a lesson, unless the student also possesses an apparatus to use for his or her individualised practice sessions. Muscle memory requires repetition. Using a tool such as a spectrograph in a weekly lesson will not give the student enough time to retain the awareness of the singing tone and to remember how to replicate it in a practice room. The majority of student work, practice, and implementation of the muscle memory of vocal technique will take place alone in the practice room. The use of technology as a means of instruction can only be successful if the teacher is constantly present with a spectrograph or other tool for feedback. Relying on a technological tool during a lesson will not help a student gain long term consistency in singing and will not foster independent awareness for the student while practicing. As well, a technological tool will have no benefit for a student attempting to make an emotional connection to the music.

It is also important to consider that if the student is instructed merely as the sum of her physiological components of singing, there can be little individualised attention. An instructor who uses scripted or sequential exercises gauging feedback through technology may not be addressing the individual needs of the student. As well, if the primary focus of instruction is on just the anatomy and mechanics of singing and does not address the individual and the artistic, emotional, and interpretive aspects of singing, the approach can be considered standardized. I believe instructing the higher education singer holistically is a more beneficial approach, in which there is a component of scientific knowledge of how the vocal mechanism functions and can help the student make the connection of correct usage of the vocal mechanism that can be practiced between lessons. This must be balanced by the instructor fostering individual creative expression and interpretation of music and text.

The next section will explore the use of imagery and imagination as a method of vocal instruction in higher education voice studios. This approach is in direct contrast to a scientific

approach, as little to no explanation of how the voice functions is used during instruction. The lack of explanation of how the voice functions may cause students to use their instruments incorrectly, and may also cause confusion for the student attempting to build consistency in singing in a practice room alone.

Imagery and Imagination

A second category of voice pedagogy considered in higher education institutions is a methodology based in imagery and imagination. It is unrelated to a scientific approach, as instruction is based on visual images presented to students as opposed to physiological and mechanical explanations of how the breath mechanism functions, how to produce vocal tone, and how to resonate the vocal tone. Imagery and imagination have been used as methods of instruction (Blades-Zeller, 2003; Clements, 2008; McKinney, 1994; Miller, 1986, 1997; Samoiloff, 1942; Smithrim, 2003; Stark, 1999; Vennard, 1967). There is considerable debate on the use of imagery in the field of higher education instruction. "Imagery and the use of images to develop vocal technique is an area in which there is as much controversy as there is interest" (Blades-Zeller, 2003). Imagery is an approach whereby a teacher presents an image for a student to consider, hoping that the end result will be the desired singing tone. Bunch (2005) discusses the difficulty in finding a resonant singing tone, "the quality of the human voice that is unique with every individual; and at the same time it is the most difficult to study and quantify" (p. 68). Bunch suggests students have a "vivid imagination" in order to learn to find a resonant singing tone (p. 70).

Historically, a teaching approach based in imagery was a rebellion against the scientific approach presented by Garcia and other pedagogues using science-based teaching practices (Clements, 2008; Miller, 1997; Reid, 1972; Stark, 1999). Reid (1972) states, "The advance of technology and the advent of the scientific era, the proponents of Bel Canto training were left defenceless" (p. 4). Teachers who were resistant to change argued against science, and "a new generation of teachers came along to confront a world in a process of change" (p. 4).

Imagery is at times used in vocal instruction to convey breath technique to students. Blades-Zellers' (2003) observations of higher education voice instructors indicated some images used by the instructors for breath instruction. Examples of images included "describe the breath much like a swimmer's breath" (p. 94), or an image of a steel tube through which the student must visualise his or her breath. Other instructors presented images such as "breathe as if you are pleasantly surprised about something" (p. 98). Further images for how to breathe were explained as " image the body as a balloon to be expanded," or "breathing in through one-hundred noses located on a belt around the waist," and "breathing into the arms, legs, neck or other parts of the body" (p. 24).

These images may not give a student a clear and pragmatic indication of how to inhale and expand the rib cage by allowing the diaphragm muscle to lower at the base of the rib cage. Perhaps if a student were shown an illustration of the diaphragm muscle in a relaxed position shaped as a cap, combined with an explanation of the mechanics of the diaphragm muscle lowering and expanding, it might give a clearer indication of a low abdominal breath and how the ribs expand.

Some instructors in institutions use a pedagogical approach based in imagery to instruct resonance in the singing tone. Edwin (2011) describes how he uses the image of a pear to teach resonance to voice students. He states, "In voice pedagogy circles, the term 'pear-shaped tone'

has fallen into disuse. Popular in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, the phrase describes a tone that is full, clear, warm, and resonant" (p. 193). Edwin continues, "No matter whether the vocal pear is small, medium, or large, it is important for every singer to explore all of his or her pear" (p. 194). This use of imagery and, in particular, the visual image of a round tone draws some parallels to the German national school of singing whereby students are instructed to think of their tone as round and are presented with the image of a rounded piece of fruit in their throats to accomplish this tone.

Smithrim (2003), writing of how she was instructed by a well-known voice teacher, and she makes the assumption that "all singing teachers use imagery to communicate ideas about the physical process of singing" (p. 56). Yet clearly all teachers do not use imagery and some may choose a more holistic approach. She describes the "hidden pedagogy" (p. 56) of her lessons. Smithrim writes how her teacher tells her to "wash her face with sound" (p. 56), she was to rub her face, and to hum while pretending to wash her face. The teacher presents this image as a way to teach Smithrim resonance, but without Smithrim being aware that she was learning how to resonate her voice. Further, gives an image of how to sing high notes. She indicates that Smithrim should "imagine that the sound was coming out of the top of my head and to use my hand flying off my head to help me visualize the physical process" (p. 56). This was supposed to teach Smithrim to relax her jaw so she could sing high notes. Using this imagery raises the question of why a teacher would not simply ask the student to relax her jaw and let her experience that feeling of relaxation. Smithrim describes several approaches to singing a correct ah [a] vowel. Her teacher tells her to sing an ah [a] vowel, "as if you were looking at two little kittens curled up on a pillow" (p. 56) or as if "you just discovered you had locked your keys in the car, now as if you were walking alone at night and something brushed against your arm" (p. 56). This "hidden pedagogy" is intended to teach one to relax the tongue, lips, and throat; however, without a clear indication of the goal from an instructor, it may not result in relaxation.

Ristad (1982) gives workshops for musicians. She uses imagery in her workshops, presenting such ideas as asking students to stretch out on the floor to try to find a resonant singing tone. One soprano was encouraged to balance on her head to find her resonant, ringing tone, then instructed to imagine the same feeling when standing. Other images and ideas given to singers were to try to "sing it ugly," try to "sound shrill," "drink the sound," "sing on the interest not the capital," "think horizontally,"and then in other cases, "think vertically. " These ideas are intended to aid in singing tension free and technically correct (1982). It is unclear how instructing a student to try to sound bad or shrill will promote consistent singing. These images are contradicting the type of sound a student should attempt to make. They are confusing and ambiguous.

Several of the higher education voice instructors Blades-Zeller (2003) surveyed were asked about the use of imagery to instruct singing with a resonant singing tone. Some instructors indicated they used images such as, "smile under or behind the eyes" (p. 87), or suggested that a student should think "up and over" (p. 94). Other instructors attempted to instruct resonance through imagery by suggesting that a student should "let that sound go out over her glasses" (p. 89) or imagine that "sometimes the sound is like a waterfall going backward in your throat" (p. 96). Students were told to "imagine you are singing out the back of your head" (p. 99). Other ambiguous ideas presented to students about resonance were to think of the vocal tone as the point of a triangle or as curves or squares, or to imagine the vocal tone as a piece of wire that must carry current. These images are supposed to instruct the student in how to place or focus the tone. An additional image presented suggested that a student should think "he/she is eating a hot pizza and doesn't want the cheese to stick to the roof of the mouth" (p. 95). This image is

supposed to help a student lift the palate, although it is unclear how a student can make a connection between the image of hot pizza and lifting the palate. Some of these images—for example the idea of singing out of the back of the head— show parallels to ideas presented in the German national school of thought. Some of the tenets of the German school promote control, pressure at the back of the throat, and constriction of the sternum. These may cause tension in the throat and will likely not help consistency in singing. With many of the images presented to students, their creators do not consider how a student may be able to use the same image to replicate the same sound in a practice room.

An image may help a student sing a correct tone during a lesson with the guidance of a teacher; however, without making a concrete connection to the image and understanding how to physically reproduce the same tone in a practice room, a student may not be able to sing in the same manner. If mistakes occur, the student will be imprinting incorrect muscle memory. Wei (2006) reviewed a study testing the effect imagery-based teaching by several higher education instructors has on pitch accuracy, sound pressure level, and singing power ratio. This was tested with the use of acoustic analysis. The results showed that although some students responded to imagery during lessons, the use of imagery as a methodology had no prevailing effect on pitch, sound pressure, and power in singing.

The use of imagery may cause confusion for an inexperienced student and may not be a beneficial pedagogical approach to use in the voice studio. Deirdre Michael writes (2011):

> The use of imagery is a time honored method of teaching singing, but many useful images are actually at odds with physiologic reality. The problem is that some singers will confuse imagery with reality, and base their technique on a concept that was useful as an image, but dangerous as a core belief. This seems especially true with concepts that are formed early in the development of singing, and then followed subconsciously throughout the development of the mature technique. It may behoove us, as singing teachers, to differentiate between images and physiologic reality, so that our students use their images more appropriately. (p. 417)

The unique singing tone of each person must be based on an individual physical awareness and a sensation and experience of where the voice is vibrating. The student must have something concrete to rely on in order to be able to practice this behavior.

Many higher education voice instructors do not believe that vocal instruction based in imagery is particularly successful. The following are several examples. My former teacher, Patricia Misslin (1997), did not use a great deal of imagery in instruction. If she spoke of imagery, it was only in relation to interpretation of text and music. The central tenets of her teaching methodology were based in an individualised interpretation of text and the acquisition of strong musicianship. Her technical approach was quite natural, as I will review in the next section of pedagogical approaches. Dale Moore (in Blades-Zellar, 2003) states, "I use very little imagery because I find that unless the students can hook into what you mean by that image, it doesn't mean much" (p. 88). Barbara Doscher indicates, "For technical matters, I speak in general to the muscles, not the brain" (p. 92). Richard Miller says" The voice is an acoustic and physical instrument, it is not correct, in my viewpoint, to make up imagery about physical and acoustic process because those factors are factual" (p. 87). Joan Wall indicates, "All learning is sensory based? We learn by what we feel, hear and see" (p. 92). These instructors believe that instructing a student how to use the muscles related to a resonant singing tone with clear explanations is a better approach than the use of imagery. The use of imagery for the purpose of text interpretation can be beneficial. Often song texts are poems or a depiction of the emotions of

a character. Imagery and imagination can be beneficial for a student trying to make an emotional connection to a poem by visualising the scene or character.

One does not find similar characteristics in an approach based in vocal science and anatomy and one based in imagery. They are quite distinct. An instructor who uses a scientific approach instructs technique based on the mechanics of the voice and how it functions, perhaps incorporating the use of a voice spectrograph or other technology. An instructor using an approach based in imagery presents students with images that must be translated by the student to vocal technique. A disconnect is apparent in using a pedagogical approach based solely in imagery. The student may have difficulty connecting a visual or verbal image to an actual kinesthetic sensation of tone or to the idea of how to use his or her breath. A more literal or physiological explanation of how the voice functions may result in clearer physical awareness of tone and the breath mechanism. This awareness can be memorised and replicated by the student in the practice room, resulting in consistency in singing instead of the student's attempt to recall images of hot pizza, triangles, pears, and copper wire. Perhaps an approach that involves an instructor explaining and preparing the student for where he or she will physically feel vibration, awareness, or sensation of vocal tone, while addressing the singer holistically, can result in more success. In other words, it may be perhaps most helpful to blend a pedagogical approach based in science and anatomy with clear, concise explanations of sensory awareness with an approach using some imagery to foster expressive singing.

The next section will consider a natural approach to vocal instruction. The natural approach will show tenets similar to those in the historic French school of thought. There will be little focus placed on the anatomy of the vocal mechanism. As well, in the natural approach there is little instruction on the use of breath support or consideration of placement of the vocal tone.

Natural Approach

An additional category that is used in higher education is the natural approach. This approach is unrelated to a scientific approach, but has similar tenets to those found in an approach based in imagery. In a natural pedagogical approach, there is little discussion of the mechanics or physiological aspects of singing. The underpinnings of a natural approach to singing are natural breath, as in speech, singing related to the speaking voice, natural or relaxed posture, and a tension-free body. There is some similarity to a method based in imagery, as students are presented with calming images or are encouraged to dance as a way to engage in natural, tension-free singing. The tenets of an approach in natural instruction parallel much of what was described in the French national school of singing. Breath support is quite natural and speech-like, posture is natural, and much of the focus is placed in text interpretation and poetic imagery.

An instructor using a natural method does not base instruction on the mechanics of singing, as this may cause tension and the natural teacher feels it unnecessary. Fields (1947) states, "Because of the involuntary nature of vocal action it is not necessary for the singer to have knowledge of the structure of his vocal organs in order to govern their action properly" (p. 34). The central tenets of this approach are natural breathing and a natural approach to tone; in other words, the student should not consider tone placement, resonance, or breath support.

The notion of breath support is notable in a natural approach. Several of the instructors reviewed use a natural approach to teaching breath management. One male instructor uses an approach of "non-interference" (Blades-Zeller, 2003, p. 84). He attempts to bring students to a "natural poise of balance" before singing (p. 84). This is an attempt to encourage the student to

take in breath and sing tension free. One of the female instructors interviewed does not teach breath support and uses an approach similar to the interpretive method focusing on tone and text. She speaks about other aspects of singing and assumes the student will inevitably breathe well. She does not encourage breath support as she feels it may result in pressure and tension. One of the other female instructors surveyed gives images to encourage natural inhalation; she gives students calming and pleasant images for relaxation or ideas of breathing in colors and filling the body with the warmth of the colors (2003). Another female surveyed uses a very natural approach to breath instruction. Much of her instruction of breath revolves around movement in the melodic line, with the idea that the breath moves through the music. Another female instructor in the survey also uses musical phrases and movement to instruct vocal tone and the feeling of movement in the breath (2003). This approach may not result in a coordinated and consistent singing. Though some students may have natural coordination of the muscles, some training is required. Miller (1986) indicates:

> It may be commendable, if you are a naturally coordinated animal, never giving thought to the breath (you do not think about breath when you are not singing, so why when you sing?) or to any other aspect of singing technique. Inasmuch as singing is a physical as well as artistic act (and part of its artistic strength lies in the physical freedom displayed); the teaching of voice chiefly from the text and the music is mostly inadequate. (p. 210)

The result may be singers who are not creating the full capacity of sound they can make if not using adequate breath support, in other words they will not have the ability to produce a sound that will carry or project. This is similar to the prevalence of lighter voices found in the French national school of singing. If the student uses minimal breath or is taught to breathe as in speaking, this will limit the sound power ratio potential. When a singer finds an optimal resonant singing tone, the amount of breath that is expelled determines how much volume or power he or she will make. If a student wishes to sing as a soloist above an orchestra and choir, for example, it is necessary that he or she know how to use the breath to find a full sound. It is similar to when one strikes the keys of an acoustic piano; if one lightly touches the key, the result will be a light, thin tone. Or if one bows a violin or cello without strength in the bowing arm, the result will be a soft, thin tone. As well, it takes strength to produce a clear tone at low volume, whether singing, playing piano, violin, or cello. There must be energy in the tone.

Several instructors use text, speech, and diction as a natural approach when instructing singing and the release of tension (Blades-Zeller, 2003; Fields, 1947; Miller, 1997). One uses diction as a tool to diagnose and release tension. She encourages stretching, and gives students cues such as telling them to have "peace at the center" (p. 79). Another instructs by having students engage in "non-singing sounds" (p. 39). He has students begin with diction— crying certain words, and then eventually connecting the words to sustained singing tones. An additional instructor interviewed also uses a natural approach of connecting the speaking voice to the singing tone (2003). Misslin uses a pedagogical method that is natural. Much focus is placed on interpretation of text, diction, and musicality. She does not address vocal registers, anatomy, or speak of resonant singing tones. This approach can help build artistry and interpretative skills, but may need to be balanced with a scientific approach.

Natural singing is also instructed using a rote method involving imitation. Samoiloff (1942), remarks that a voice student "learns best by imitation" (p. 13). In this natural method, the student is instructed to imitate the sound or vocal tone produced by the teacher or from a recording. The student is not instructed as to how to produce the sound, but is asked just to imitate the sound.

Samoiloff continues by describing a natural method of instruction involving imagery, and discusses a method that goes beyond the anatomy of singing, stating, "In direct contrast to the mechano-physiological[viii] school is that group of teachers who preach the 'natural' method, sometimes dubbed the 'sing-like-the-birdies-sing method'" (p. 12). This method involves thinking of a beautiful tone and then repeating it. One of the male instructors interviewed instructs students to "imagine the most beautiful sound you think you're capable of making, then try it" (Blades-Zeller, 2003, p. 99). This form of imitation may not address the individual singer and her unique tone. If a student is trying to imitate the singing tone of the teacher or others, then he or she is not developing his or her individual sound.

Passion and meditation are also encouraged within a natural approach to instruction. Madeline Bruser (2011) discusses how a teacher can guide the student to passion. "In making music, we mix passion with discipline. Our love for a piece of music motivates us to become intimate with it by producing the sound ourselves, with our instrument and our own body" (p. 106). Bruser's approach entails freeing the individual from tension through meditation. Although many teachers believe that meditation can instill passion or emotion, Bruser does not clearly present how meditation will help a student to sing technically well.

In the next example, the author suggests modeling passion as a way to instruct. Wurgler writes (1997), "Teachers must feed the passion for singing that brought them into a life in the arts in the first place. They must model that love and share it enthusiastically with others, most importantly, their students" (p. 7)

In a similar perspective to meditation and passion, some instructors use a natural approach involving dancing and drumming as a way to encourage natural movement and release of tension in the singer. Ristad (1982) uses this method in her natural approach to instruction. She uses drumming, improvisation, and dancing as a way for students to find natural posture and release physical, mental, and emotional tension. This method addresses just one aspect of singing, the release of tension, and may not result in a student finding a consistent singing sound and developing the ability to sing in a healthy manner.

Another concept found in a natural approach to instructing voice in higher education institutions is the Alexander Technique®. The Alexander Technique was created by Frederick Matthias Alexander in the 1890s. He created the technique in response to his own vocal health issues and as a result of losing his voice during acting performances. Briefly, the process in the Alexander Technique is to release all muscular tension in the body and to align the neck and spine, returning oneself to a natural posture. It uses elements of tension and muscle release combined with natural breathing and balance. The first step is to release tension, the next is to learn new ways of holding oneself, then how to breathe in the most natural manner and, finally, to learn how to physically and mentally react to situations that may cause tension. Higher education voice instructors generally do not teach this technique; however, voice instructors commonly refer many students to Alexander coaches (Alexander, 2001; Blades-Zeller, 2003; Brennan & Marwood, 2004; Miller, 1986, 1997; Morgan, 2010; Jones, 1997). The Alexander Technique is becoming part of the curriculum in many music departments. [ix]

Some of the underpinnings in this approach can be beneficial for the voice student. I believe the principles of good posture and tension release and the importance placed on expressiveness are quite positive. There is, however, a concern with such little emphasis on awareness of the vocal mechanism and how it functions, as well as the natural, speech-like approach to instructing breath control. This lack of awareness of how the voice functions and the little emphasis placed on breath support for the fragile vocal mechanism may lead to vocal fatigue, hoarseness, and

potential long term damage (Frederick, 2006; Sataloff, 1998; Teachey, Kahane & Beckford, 1991).

The Feldenkrais Method® may also be considered a natural approach as it was created to return one to a natural posture, and to create awareness of motions or movement that may cause pain or fatigue in the body. The method was created by Dr. Moshé Feldenkrais (1990), as a result of his inability to recover from an injury. Feldenkrais decided to explore the possibilities of approaching his body's reaction to the injury differently. There are two different sources of pain, limitation of movement, and discomfort: physical conditions, as well as unconscious choices one makes in how one moves. It is an experimental method in which the individual engages in self-awareness of how certain movement may affect how one feels. There are two aspects to the Feldenkrais Method: the process of Awareness Through Movement (ATM), which is a guided group session; and Functional Integration (FI), which is a one-on-one hands-on session with a Feldenkrais practitioner. Nelson and Blades (2005) explain the five ideas involved in the method: "1) Life as a process, 2) effective movement involves the whole self as necessary for effective movement,3) learning as the key activity of humans, 4) the necessity of choice, and 5) the logic of human development. That life is a process should be self-evident" (p. 147). When they examined the use of Feldenkrais in the voice studio, Dr. Nelson applied hands on FI and Dr. Blades examined physical issues that students displayed while singing. The Feldenkrais method, as it applies to vocal instruction, appears to have some beneficial elements. Any activity that instills self-awareness in a student can be beneficial for gaining consistency in singing. Awareness of the breath and how it functions, as well as integrating movement that is conducive to better breath control is beneficial for students. As well, the notion of addressing posture and striving for tension-free movement is helpful for singers. The use of the Feldenkrais method in combination with a pedagogical approach involving knowledge and vocal science and anatomy, and the facilitation of an emotional connection to text, perhaps through some use of imagery, may help build consistency and emotional engagement in students.

Singing is far from a natural activity. It is an athletic undertaking. It takes more than a natural approach to manage the onset and release of a supported vocal tone, to maintain good posture, and to be able to change the shape of the vocal tract (through how much the mouth is opened, the palate lifted, and the shape and position of the tongue), which in turn affects the passive resonators located in the throat and chest.

The next section explores what are considered holistic approaches to vocal instruction. These are approaches that proponents claim address the singer and complete person and incorporate the mind, body, spirit, and experience of the person. As I will describe, considerable focus is placed on the use of breath for relaxation and the release of tension. This approach may not help to mitigate inconsistent singing if it does not also address other aspects of the singer beyond the breath.

Further Critique

These pedagogical approaches represent the varied ways voice is currently instructed in higher education music institutions. Current methods of vocal instruction find their historic roots in the German, French, Italian, and English traditions of instruction. For a student of vocal pedagogy, a new voice instructor, or currently practicing voice instructor in higher education, these national categories are quite broad and present challenges in finding a pedagogical method that he or she may use. Specifically, they do not address ways to approach aspects of the instruction of vocal

technique, but rather provide an overview of a traditional approach to singing, or a desired sound or posture, for example. A new voice teacher may not find using an approach from the European tradition beneficial for instruction in North American higher education institutions. It is important, however, for students and teachers to be aware of these national traditions that have influenced current pedagogy.

Instructional models based in vocal science and anatomy, imagery and imagination, and natural approaches were examined for this research study. Some of these models of instruction have limitations and may be considered to address just one aspect of instruction and not take the entire singer into consideration. Focusing on just one aspect on instruction will not give the student or teacher access to what he or she can truly become as a teacher or as a student. A teacher who is exposed to and well versed in numerous approaches has the ability to choose from his or her skill set to find the best method to instruct each student as an individual. This instructor will have the ability to be a flexible facilitator of vocal technique, addressing each student's different needs. In having the ability to utilize a varied skill set, the teacher is not limited, and thus the student benefits from this knowledge. The teacher must first facilitate vocal technique using a varied, individualised and flexible approach so that the student sings consistently and has the ability to be expressive.

There cannot be a standardized or set approach to vocal instruction, given that each student and voice is unique and must be approached in various ways. A scientific approach, for example, appears quite prescriptive, in that each student may be given the same set of standardized exercises without addressing her individual needs. Equally, a pedagogy based solely in imagery is too ambiguous, and a natural approach may leave the student lacking full vocal development. If the student is not using adequate breath support, for example, she may not develop her full vocal sound and may encounter vocal health issues. Singing is an athletic activity that requires management of the respiratory system. If one considers a more holistic approach, it should address all aspects of the individual mind, body, spirit, and emotions.

In this study, I am not suggesting that these approaches cannot provide some benefit to students in vocal development, but rather I wish to present a way to look at some guiding principles of vocal instruction that use a broad spectrum of the presented approaches in a fluid and flexible manner and attempt to mitigate inconsistent and unemotional singing.

The student-teacher relationship in the voice studio should involve the teacher facilitating good vocal technique, awareness of the instrument and how it functions scientifically, and good vocal health. This can be attempted by using a balanced approach to ensure the student is able to sing technically correctly and consistently while remaining aware of vocal health. The teacher must, however, also foster an experience of joy and artistic interpretation in singing to keep this important live art form relevant in a culture where so much is manufactured and created artificially. Some use of imagery for engaging the emotions of the student in a song or text can be helpful in guiding emotional experience. Instruction using some of the tenets of tension-free singing in the natural approach can be helpful for a student to release tension in the body and vocal tone.

The limitation that these varied approaches have is that the teacher is not instructing the student as a complete singer, both as a technically proficient musician and an artist, but rather is appearing to offer compartmentalised instruction of just certain aspects of singing. A gap exists in these approaches. Many of the methods examined focus on just the technical aspects of singing; specifically, finding a way to produce a good vocal tone. Some teaching methods examined, such as those based in science and anatomy, attempt to help build technical

proficiency through scientific awareness of how the voice functions. These methods may be helpful in building consistency in singing, but are lacking in helping to engage emotions. Others attempt to help the student sing in a desired way through the use of imagery as a means to find his or her singing tone. This may be help the student find a clear and released tone during a lesson, but may present a challenge for the student to reproduce in a practice room. The natural approach may consistent of encouraging the student to "do nothing," or may focus on relaxation. These methods attempt to teach consistency in singing. As argued in the previous sections, many pedagogical approaches address just one aspect of singing and may not all help foster consistency. These methods fail to consider the complete singer as an artist who is capable of exploring choice and artistic freedom of expression.

Using a balanced, truly holistic approach to vocal instruction, the teacher will consider the singer as a complete person, as a human being capable of making artistic choices. An all-encompassing method may provide students with knowledge and awareness of how to sing consistently, as well guide them to explore artistic choice, thus giving them an opportunity to emotionally engage during performance in this unique art form.

Conclusions of the Pedagogical Approaches

The voice teacher's goal is fostering the student to become an artist, to reach a level of technical proficiency and independence so that he or she can make artistic choices in performance. Many methods attempt to encourage a student to make a desired vocal tone through the use of vocal science, through imagery or imagination, through meditation, or through the use of singing related to speech. These methods leave a gap, and appear not to help mitigate inconsistent singing. As well, they fall short in fostering emotions and artistic choice in performance.

The source of inconsistent and emotionally unengaged singing, I believe, is the teacher, and how she is instructing the student. What is not being explored in these pedagogical methods is the facilitative relationship between a teacher and student, the role of the teacher, and how effective he or she is in this relationship. Teachers do not usually address or consider how they relate to students (Brown, 2000).

With certain teaching approaches, such as those based in imagery, natural approaches, and some based in science and anatomy, the burden appears to be on the student to produce a desired vocal tone. What must be examined is the teacher: how the teacher has a responsibility; and can have the ability to choose from a varied set of teaching tools to help foster consistency and independence in singing. This is done through guidance, and through not leaving the student to find this consistency alone. An exploration of the role of the teacher will examine how the teacher can instruct and guide the student to find consistency and artistry in singing.

In both the technical and natural approaches to singing, the role of the teacher is not sufficiently examined. The goal as voice instructors is to instruct singers to become independent artists. Students, however, must be guided to find a level of technical consistency and artistic choice in order to experience this independence and ability to make choices. These teaching approaches lack an articulation or development of how to translate information to the voice student. There must be an articulation of a teaching method, in which the teacher can choose a flexible approach to vocal instruction encompassing any of the varied methods described, depending on the situation presented in each lesson and the individualised student's needs. There must be a student-teacher relationship based in freedom of choice, both for the teacher and student. The teacher can choose any number of approaches to help the student make a connection

to technically proficient singing. An all-encompassing approach can help facilitate consistent singing. Using this approach, the teacher guides the student to take responsibility and an active role in the facilitated relationship. The student is not left to mitigate the murky waters of technically proficient singing alone. The student who has consistency in singing can be guided to have artistic freedom and to make choices leading to emotionally engaged performances. As well, a relationship that is based in responsibility can be considered. The teacher is responsible for helping the student make connections to gain consistency in singing. The student can be made aware of his or her responsibility in the learning process and take an active role in building this consistency, thus making artistic choices.

In this research study, I will look at ways to reconsider and reframe how we think about vocal instruction and the student-teacher relationship in the voice studio. I will present principles that have been underexplored in the application of vocal instruction. In the next sections, I will introduce the consideration and use of several existentialist principles such as freedom and responsibility, and argue how these may be applied to vocal instruction.

Existentialism: Definitions and Application

Introduction
In this section of the paper, I will further examine the relationship of the student and teacher and the aspects of vocal instruction that I believe are not fully addressed in this relationship in current teaching methods, as discussed in the previous chapter. After examining the limitations presented in the various teaching approaches, I will consider some of the theoretical principles of existentialism as an approach to address these limitations.

Some existentialist principles have been considered in the student-teacher relationship in an application to general education, but have not yet been considered in an application to vocal instruction. This research study presents an opportunity to expand current research in the field of vocal instruction and pedagogy, and offers a teaching approach for consideration. Drawing upon some of the key principles of existentialism, I consider how inconsistent and unemotional singing may be repositioned. This theoretical lens provides the foundation upon which to consider how these principles highlight certain underdeveloped aspects of vocal instruction in the student-teacher relationship in higher education. Specifically, I will introduce several existentialist principles of Sartre including *existence, essence, freedom,* and *responsibility,* as well as the *anguish* and *abandonment* that at times stem from the realization of freedom and responsibility. In discussing these tenets of Sartre's existentialist thinking and those stemming from them, I examine how these principles may be considered and may be relevant to how vocal instructors can better facilitate consistent and emotionally engaged singing.

Overview of Several Existentialist Principles of Jean-Paul Sartre
I begin with the idea of existence. Sartre's existentialism starts from the premise of existence. A human is "a being who exists before he can be defined by any concept of it" (Sartre, 2007, p. 22). The essence of a human comes only after she exists and through the choices that are made; in other words, the image of the self that she projects. In order to understand Sartre's idea of existentialism, it is necessary to understand his ideas about existence and essence. According to this description, "To say that something *exists* is to say that *it is*. To state something's *essence* is to state *what* or *how* it is" (Sartre, 2001, p. 21). Existence and essence are distinct from one

another. Sartre (1984) describes existence as our past, present, and future. Each student has a history; however, the existentialist teacher may view a new student as a blank slate, an existing presence with endless potential. Our past exists; however, it is a passive place that we can do nothing about. The present is our time of freedom, consciousness, and choice, and our future is full of possibilities. The teacher must now help the student realize free will and responsibility. The teacher regards the student as being free, and cannot force her ideas or opinions on the student, try to define the student in her own terms, or instruct her to be like the teacher; this would be considered molding a student. Molding or controlling a student is a form of imitation. Instead, the teacher facilitates the student in becoming aware of the best choices, through the teacher's guidance. The student comes to her own conclusions and discoveries. In existentialism, the student exists; however, the essence of the student is what must be discovered and created by the student, albeit guided by an effective teacher. Sartre (2007) explains and clarifies his ideas of existence and essence further. He feels that there is no predetermined human essence and no human nature prior to a human existing: "When we are born we have no essence as human beings. Only the totality of choices we make in life makes us the people who we are. In this sense we are profoundly free" (Sartre, 2001, p. 25). The voice student comes to study without essence; she merely exists, although she has vocal history. The teacher views the student as someone who is full of potential. There is no predetermined nature for the voice student. Each student will arrive at a higher education music program with various levels of ability and background. Using an existentialist approach, voice teachers can view each student as an individual and one capable of determining her essence as a singer. The sound of a student's voice and her potential cannot be defined by the teacher; it must be discovered by the student through facilitation. The voice teacher is also an individual, free to choose and project her essence as a facilitator of vocal study. In order to understand the ideas of essence and how it can be determined by the individual (in this case, the teacher), one must explore Sartre's ideas centered in being. The idea of being in Sartrean terms is defined as two manners.

Sartre (1984) felt there were two manners of being: *being-for-itself* and *being-in-itself*. Being-for-itself involves our consciousness and our awareness of it. Consciousness and awareness are important and very relevant in vocal instruction and singing. The teacher must be aware and conscious of whether or not the information facilitated to the student is understood. The voice instructor is the guide for the student, helping her make connections and discoveries. A keen awareness and sensitivity to the student through consciousness and awareness is essential in effective vocal instruction. This awareness, focus, and consciousness are necessary in order for a student to gain consistency in singing. The voice teacher should strive to be aware and conscious of the student and should be able to gauge whether or not the student is internalizing and understanding the information given. Some teachers in the voice studio may not be focused on whether or not this information is being translated successfully, and are perhaps just focused on accomplishing a certain number of exercises or singing a certain number of songs within in a given lesson. They are thus not as "tuned in" or aware of what the student is experiencing. Perhaps some teachers instruct on "auto-pilot" if they have been teaching for a long time, and perhaps they are not as enthusiastic instructors as at the start of their careers. Being-for-itself, or consciousness and awareness, are also important ideas in the act of singing. A singer or student must be aware—physically aware and conscious of what is going on— while she is singing. If a student is neither focused nor aware, she will likely continue to make the same mistakes (singing with tension, lack of resonance, or poor breath support, for example), furthering inconsistency in singing. For a singer, the body is the instrument; being-for-itself and the elements of

consciousness and awareness align with this idea. Everything one does while singing affects the tone, breath, and vocal projection. A singer must multi-task during performance. While singing, the singer must have heightened consciousness and awareness. She must be able to assess and be fully conscious and aware of what is going on with her posture, breath, diction, resonant singing tone, and any potential building of tension in the body, as it will affect her tone, and must be able to address any issues that occur during performance. For example, a singer who has tense shoulders, stiff hands, a tense jaw or tongue, or even locked knees will have a vocal tone that also is tense (Doscher, 1994). Singers are the instrument; the singer must at all times be fully conscious and aware of what she is experiencing while singing, and at the same time be aware and conscious of the musical and emotional elements in a song or aria. A student who is neither aware nor conscious may not be able to be in the moment or emotionally engaged while singing. An observer will generally be able to sense whether the student is engaged or not, as the observer's aesthetic reaction to the singer will reflect her engagement.

Being-in-itself involves how the world external to our consciousness exists. This idea is not as relevant for this study centered on vocal instruction. The world external to consciousness (being-in-itself), as it relates to singing and vocal instruction, is about the singer and teacher being physically present outside of each one's consciousness. This manner of being is not conducive to effective teaching or to gaining consistency and emotional engagement in singing. The ideas of consistency and emotionality and the attempt to instill these in a student require the focus of the teacher to be on the student-teacher relationship, as well as her consciousness and awareness of the individual student. A teacher, for example, who views her existence in the voice studio as being-in-itself will not be completely focused on the collaborative student-teacher relationship within the studio and thus will not be addressing the individual needs of the student, or whether her own facilitation is effective or not. Perhaps her focus is elsewhere, having nothing to do with the student. If the focus of the teacher is on the external world (being-in-itself), beyond the student-teacher relationship without consciousness or awareness of the individual needs of the student, the facilitative relationship with the student may not be effective.

Using the idea of being-for-itself, the teacher is focused on awareness and conscious within herself and within her student. She is conscious and aware of what information the student needs to sing well and consistently, and whether or not she is translating the information to the student effectively. She is also conscious and aware of the student's reaction to her facilitation. She is there for the student as a facilitator. If one views a student in terms relating to being-in-itself, the reaction that the world external to consciousness has to one's singing is not in one's control. In existentialist terms, the idea of being-for-itself has to do with the exploration of consciousness, freedom, and an ability to determine one's outcome. Thus, the idea of being-for-itself appears more relevant than being-in-itself in working towards a student-teacher relationship that might help improve consistency and emotional engagement in students.

Within the idea of being-for-itself there are three components: *facticity, transcendence, and temporality*. Facticity and transcendence are the components of being-for-itself that relate most to the singer as a student and performer. These two terms are dependent on each other. The exploration of one's freedom can lead to transcendence, which can alter facticity. They occur in a state where freedom of choice is exercised. Facticity has several components. First, there are the facts of a person, such as her birth or what she does as a career. Transcendence is related to facticity, in that it occurs when one exercises free will and explores freedom. It is the sum of choices, possibilities, and expectations. According to Sartre (1984), "… facticity of my place is

revealed to me only in and through the free choice which I make of my end" (p. 634). This leads to the concept of freedom and free will.

For Sartre, those exercising freedom can alter facticity through transcendence (the occurrence that comes from exploration of freedom). The voice teacher can explore her freedom to become, project, or transcend, in order to become the type of instructor she wishes to be; the type of instructor who can facilitate consistency and emotional engagement in her students, and thus alter her facticity. A student guided by a voice instructor to explore freedom can alter her facticity as a student. The student, when guided towards her freedom through effective facilitation, can perhaps transcend to find a new facticity, to define or re-define the type of student or singer she is, to influence her essence, and to explore the possibilities of what she can become. Thus, the relation of facticity and transcendence informs the very notion of one's essence.

Let me turn to essence, accordingly. An individual or teacher in being-for-itself (one that is conscious and aware) engaged in the exploration of freedom as teacher and/or student leading to transcendence can alter her facticity and determine her essence. She can become the type of instructor she desires to be. She can be the type of instructor who facilitates and guides consistent and emotional engagement in her voice students.

The idea of essence through choices stems from one's existence. The teacher can help guide the student. The teacher can help make the student aware that she has the ability, and is free, to make the decision to be a willing and open-minded student. The student has made a choice to study at the university level and, consequently, has the ability to choose to obtain as much knowledge and guidance as possible during her years of study. The student has the freedom to take a path or to not take that path; the decision is completely up to the student. Sartre says (2007), "He will not be anything until later, and then he will be what he makes of himself" (p. 22). The student has freedom and free will to determine what she will make of herself as a singer.

One may see, then, how the application of existentialism may help inform the way in which vocal instruction is approached in higher educational institutions. A voice teacher in higher education takes on responsibility, and must be ready to accept this reality. The teacher is responsible for both the student and the experience the student has in studying voice at the higher education level. The teacher must help the student to make a connection to the information that he or she wants to student to obtain. The teacher must also instill a sense of responsibility in the student and make the student aware of her part in learning new information, since "man is responsible for what he is" (Sartre, 2007, p. 23). Sartre's message is that there are simply "no excuses" (p. 29). This principle serves to instill the idea of responsibility in both student and teacher. The teacher is responsible for instruction and for helping the student to make a connection. The student is to take an active role in the learning process and is to be a stakeholder in what she will become, without excuses.

When one is in possession of oneself, this creates freedom. Freedom for this study, as discussed in Chapter One, is considered in terms of: artistic freedom, free will, and freedom for the instructor in the facilitative relationship in the voice study to explore various teaching approaches, physically free singing (without tension, and restriction), freedom to determine essence, and artistic freedom in expression. In other words, when the singer is in control, aware of her ability to choose the outcome and result of her actions, she can determine and influence her outcome. Sartre's freedom is one that depends "entirely on the freedom of others" (p. 48). The teacher is faced with her own freedom, as well as the student's. The teacher realizes the

choices she makes in instruction will affect the student. Sartre states, "I cannot set my own freedom as a goal without also setting the freedom of others as a goal"(p. 49). The student-teacher relationship viewed through an existentialist lens is one in which both teacher and students explore freedom of choice. The teacher, in this type of relationship, is aware of his or her choice in how to instruct.

According to Sartre's view of existentialism, upon the realization of this freedom and responsibility, one may at times experience both abandonment and anguish. These terms are connected. When one realizes one's freedom, one knows one cannot escape this responsibility, and thus anguish or the emotional burden of the choices one makes may ensue. Sartre believes that humans experience various states of anguish and abandonment (2007). The term abandonment is the realization that we are ultimately alone in our choices. We are free and fully responsible and therefore alone, since "man is free, man is freedom" (p. 29). Man bears the full responsibility for himself, alone. Sartre explains further, "It is we, ourselves, who decide who we are to be" (p. 34). One is abandoned, "in the sense that I find myself suddenly alone and without help engaged in a world for which I bear the whole responsibility" (Sartre, 1984, p. 710). The teacher may encounter the feeling of being abandoned and alone and experience anguish in the realization of her responsibility in instructing a student. According to Sartre (2007), "When we say that man chooses himself, not only do we mean that each of us must choose himself, but also that in choosing himself, he is choosing for all men" (p. 24). A teacher who considers using existentialist principles in her teaching approach may feel her choices and decisions might affect many in a teaching context: the students, the faculty, the institution, and the future pupils of her student. As well, the student may come to the realization that she is ultimately alone and abandoned in determining her own essence. There is a profound responsibility in making choices. The student may become aware that when she is on the stage performing, she is alone and abandoned and solely responsible for her outcome as a student and as a performer. The teacher in this relationship must think of the future of the student when the student is no longer at the institution or when the student must give solo performances, and the teacher must facilitate an ability to make choices, accept responsibility, and face feelings of anguish and abandonment. Sartre (2007) speaks of anguish as "anguish pure and simple, of the kind experienced by all who have borne responsibilities" (p. 27).

Sartre's views on abandonment and anguish perhaps at first glance may appear negative. It is important, however, to note that not all teachers or students may experience a feeling of abandonment or anguish. A teacher considering using existentialist thought may gain the ability to anticipate that the student might feel alone and experience anguish while performing and practicing. Teachers can help the student realize that existentialist ideas such as responsibility and independence in learning can be positive. The teacher is not to mold the student, as this would not respect the freedom of the student or instill responsibility or independence in singing, and is therefore ineffective instruction. This inability to sing independently may actually cause feelings of abandonment and anguish for the student, as she may feel that she does not know what she is doing. I have witnessed this look of fear in the eyes—an image of a "deer in the headlights" comes to mind— in many young singers performing on stage. This is a student who is experiencing anguish and feeling abandoned and alone on stage. This is typically noted when a singer is not confident, lacks consistency in singing, and is terrified. One can experience this feeling, also known as "nerves," while on stage. There are different types of nerves. The nerves or anguish of feeling alone and abandoned on stage are the experience of a student who feels ill-

prepared or unable to sing independently. This is quite different from a feeling of nervous excitement before stepping out on stage.

Voice instructors should strive for their students not to need them at a certain point. Students should to be able to step out on stage alone, fully responsible for their performances, filled with artistic freedom and choice, and able to face any potential feeling of anguish and abandonment. A teacher who molds students is one who teaches through imitation, striving for her students to become copies of the teacher. This will not help a student gain autonomy or independence in singing, nor will it facilitate ways to deal with potential feelings of abandonment and anguish. A voice student must have a consistent manner or technique of singing in order to feel independent, autonomous, free, and responsible as a singer. As well, this consistency can give the student the ability to deal with whatever possible feelings of anguish and abandonment may occur alone in a practice room or while alone on stage performing. In some voice studios, the students sound the same as the teacher, although the teacher may have an entirely different voice type (vocal maturity, range, vocal weight, and color). The teacher who guides or facilitates the student is one who offers information and presents opportunities for the student to come to her own discoveries, and in so doing, facilitates an ability to gain responsibility and independence. Voice instructors should attempt to prepare students and to facilitate the most consistent singing possible for the student. In some cases, however, it is important to note that a student may still experience feelings of anguish and abandonment, even if the teacher has facilitated consistent singing. Some students will experience immense fear, no matter how well their teachers try to prepare them for these feeling of anguish and abandonment.

The teacher, like the student, may also experience feelings of anguish and abandonment with the realization of her immense responsibility as a voice instructor. This can also appear negative at first glance, as noted at the beginning of this discussion regarding the potentially negative view of Sartre's idea of anguish and abandonment. The teacher is responsible for helping the student find consistency in singing and must guide the student to find artistry in singing; this is a great deal of responsibility. A voice instructor can, however, consider an existentialist framework as a way to look at this responsibility in a positive light, and so perhaps can find ways to not feel anguish or abandonment. For example, a teacher using existentialist thought may consider ways to not feel trapped in using just one teaching approach in vocal instruction. Perhaps existentialist thought can free the teacher from a feeling of constraint by offering her the opportunity to explore her freedom to try different teaching approaches. I believe it can be empowering for a teacher to become aware that she can determine her essence as a teacher. She can experience being-for-itself in a way that transcendence happens (the sum of freedom, choices, and possibilities) and have the power to alter her facticity as a voice instructor. As well, a student can be guided to embrace the idea of responsibility in existentialist terms. A student who can be guided to a sense of responsibility and exploration of freedom may have the potential to feel empowered and filled with confidence in performance rather than alone and abandoned. A teacher who uses existentialist principles and encompasses a varied approach may help the student gain consistency in singing. A student who can sing consistently is one that is empowered and confident. A student who feels she has a strong grasp of how to sing consistently may have the ability to step out alone on stage, and feel confident and excited to explore the possibilities of what she can experience on stage. In this moment, the student can experience transcendence and, potentially, can give a truly artistic performance. I suggest that existentialist principles can be considered a very positive influence on a teaching approach in vocal instruction.

The next section will explore and further develop the reasons and rationale for choosing to view the student-teacher relationship in the voice studio through an existentialist lens. I will illustrate how existentialism has already influenced a framework for the student-teacher relationship in general education, and will continue to argue how existentialist tenets may be considered in a pedagogical approach to vocal instruction. This study represents a way for vocal instructors to consider and reframe how they view vocal instruction in higher education. I suggest that the student-teacher relationship in the higher education voice studio, if viewed through an existentialist lens, can be one that is a collaborative relationship, where both teacher and student can experience growth as artists. In existentialist terms, both teacher and student engage in a relationship based in exploring freedom and responsibility, simultaneously. The voice instructor grows from the experience of instructing the student, just as the student grows and develops in her singing practice. In a relationship that is student-centered, such as one that will be considered in an existentialist framework for this study, a student may acquire an ability to participate in selecting repertoire. This is a part of accepting responsibility and gaining independence. It is also possible, if a student is guided to sing consistently by an effective instructor, for the student and teacher to discuss and analyze the student's individual interpretation of a piece of music, her choices, and her vision for the song. Once a student can sing with vocal consistency, many possibilities of emotional interpretation open, as the student is not distracted and delayed in this process by her lack of consistent singing. I consider that the student-teacher relationship based in existentialist thought can be one that is considered collaborative, in the sense that it is student-centered and the path that the course of study takes depends very much on the student and her progress. There can be an extended discussion between teacher and student on vocal development. It is the duty and responsibility of voice instructors to help students find a consistent vocal technique and to make an emotional connection to the music they are studying. Once an instructor accepts a student into her private studio, she is taking on the responsibility of this student. An existentialist overview of instruction can perhaps act as a guideline for a novice, or even experienced, teacher. At the same time, perhaps it will give the teacher the opportunity to explore her own freedom and potential as an instructor, while leading the student to consistent singing and emotionally.

Van Manen (1991), when discussing the tact and art of teaching, suggests that novice teachers must spend time finding out who they are. Perhaps existentialism can offer both novice voice teachers in higher education and currently practicing teachers the opportunity to reflect on who they are as instructors. I suggest that existentialism offers a unique way to view oneself as a voice teacher. It can present voice teachers with ways to reflect on responsibility, ways to think about guiding students to sing consistently and with emotion, and opportunities to think about what it means to face freedom and free will as these can be explored in the student-teacher relationship in the voice studio. It can present the opportunity to examine effectiveness as a facilitator of vocal development. For voice teachers, the goal should be to help the student gain independence, to not need the instructor and to, eventually, no longer hold status as a student but rather as an artist. A teacher must find effective ways to ensure this transition happens for a voice student. The teacher must find a way to guide the student in voice study without being overbearing or interfering with the student's freedom and free will. She must act as a role model and facilitator, and take on the responsibility of instructing each student while finding a way to maintain a balance in which the student is guided but not molded or controlled in her vocal development or interpretive choices.

The pedagogical methods that were examined in the previous chapter do not sufficiently address the student-teacher relationship in the voice studio. They focus on instructing certain aspects of vocal technique, but do not address the complete student and his or her experience in vocal study. In considering existentialism as a framework for a pedagogical approach to vocal instruction, it may be possible to examine the effectiveness of the student-teacher relationship and perhaps to offer a way of viewing the entire student. This approach attempts to instruct the student in a method that can encompass all aspects of instructing vocal technique and bringing the student to the level where she can explore artistic freedom and interpretation of music. It is a challenge for a student to reach this level of freedom if she is constantly distracted by the inability to sing consistently.

The next section will explore existentialism and how it has already been used as a theoretical framework for education. I will discuss the principles of responsibility and freedom in further detail, and argue further how they can be considered in vocal instruction.

Existentialism, Education, and Effective Vocal Instruction

This section provides the underpinning foundation of how existentialism has been applied to education theory in terms of the student-teacher relationship, humanistic education, and the individual and her experience and potential. I start with existentialism and its application to education to establish an *a priori* assumption that the principles of existentialism have relevance for educational theory and practice. In drawing upon this literature, I then extend this discussion to consider how an existentialist framework may inform the way in which educators consider the art of vocal instruction in higher education to mitigate inconsistent and unemotional singing in students.

I begin with some examples of how existentialist principles have been considered as a theoretical framework in general education and illustrate how they might be also be viewed as a framework for vocal instruction. I then discuss central ideas in Sartre's existential principles: responsibility and freedom, and how these may be considered beneficial in the student-teacher relationship in the voice studio. I will argue that these principles can provide consideration of a student-teacher relationship in the voice studio that strives to inspire individuality and responsibility, and thus leads students to gain independence and autonomy in singing and an ability to find freedom in artistic expression.

The principles of responsibility and freedom are interrelated in existentialist thought, which may have relevance in the application to vocal instruction. This will be discussed further in the following section. The concept of responsibility will be explored in existentialist terms for vocal instruction. The voice instructor is responsible for the student in this facilitative relationship and should make every effort to help the student reach a level of consistency in singing. Vocal instructors are called upon to facilitate consistent singing in their students. In order to be effective, this requires an ability to facilitate consistency. In this study, this ability will be considered by viewing an existentialist framework including the flexibility that allows for using varying pedagogical approaches. In this vein, the student can also be encouraged to take on responsibility in the learning process. She can be made aware that her outcome will be the sum of the elements put into the process by the student. In taking on this responsibility, both teacher and student face and explore their freedom in the student-teacher relationship.

The principle of freedom will be explored later in this section in terms of free will, choice, physically free singing, and artistic freedom. When considering the notion of freedom in an existentialist framework, an instructor is in a position to present the student with the ability to choose, to have a stake in what she will project and what she will become as a singer. The notion of freedom for the voice instructor will be viewed in part as the opportunity to choose and to explore freedom in this student-teacher relationship. In existentialist terms, she may have the chance to project the type of voice instructor she wishes to be or become, and to alter her facticity (the sum of the facts about the individual) to become the type of instructor who can facilitate consistency and emotional engagement in her students. Consideration of an existentialist outlook on instruction may also offer choice. A voice instructor may wish to consider acting upon free will to choose how she will instruct her students, whether or not she will be an effective facilitator of voice, and how she will accomplish this—and then make strides to do so.

The Application of Existentialism to General Education

The parallels of existentialism, education, and the student-teacher relationship are notable. In order to understand the application of existentialist principles as part of education theory, it is important to examine the historical perspective of their application to general education prior to discussing the principles of responsibility and freedom in more detail and how these may also be considered in vocal instruction in higher education today.

Existentialist ideas and the possibilities of an education based in existentialism were explored in the preliminary stages of the existentialists' prominence by Van Cleve Morris (1954). His research explored the student-teacher relationship and how the teacher, using an existentialist approach, could strive towards educating the individual learner. Morris' (1961) early research centred on pedagogy for children based in existentialism and the opinion that education should provide a private and individual experience for the child. Morris examined the possibilities of existentialism in education at a time when not many researchers had considered the application of existentialist thought to education. He considered how existentialism could be a fitting foundation for an educational teaching method. Morris writes that existentialist teachers "will be more interested in developing the affective side of man, his capacity to love, to appreciate, to respond emotionally to the world around him" (p. 255).

The idea of responding "emotionally" and perhaps developing a pedagogical approach to elicit capacity for an emotional response and experience draws parallels to voice students and instructors searching for ways to emotionally engage and find appreciation in music. Existentialist principles may offer ways for instructors to aid in the development of an emotional reaction to music from voice students. Morris explains that the content of what the individual puts in this private experience is quite important, indicating "the existentialist educator is necessarily interested in having the youngster fill his quiet moments with the personal judgements he must make concerning his own life" (Morris, 1961, p. 59). In this way, the personal judgements to which an individual becomes attentive bridge her awareness of freedom and responsibility in learning. One can also look at how progress might be made in voice study when the student is reminded by the instructor that her outcome will be in her own control. This idea and "quiet moments" and "personal judgements" parallel many of the experiences of a vocal student. The daily rituals of a vocal student require that she be in a state of being with a quiet reflective mind that offers the opportunity for the student to explore freedom (artistic) and free will in interpretation of music and text, such as can occur in a practice room for a singer.

In addition to the awareness of self, Morris discusses the idea of responsibility, giving the student a stake in her learning through choice, where "the existentialist educator would seem to be committed to the task of developing the choice-making power in the individual" (Morris, 1961, p. 256). In this way, the emphasis becomes on fostering the individual's capacity to both be attentive in quiet contemplation and, further, to understand the judgements and decisions that are required within the self. In understanding the discretionary choices that are involved, the voice student becomes empowered, and a stakeholder in her own vocal development.

Education theory based in existentialist thought emphasises the focus placed on the individual student holistically. It looks for ways to instruct the entire student and not just certain aspects of the individual. In some respects, existentialism and its application to education gained prominence as perhaps a criticism of or response to previous teaching approaches such as a mass-produced or rote method of teaching. Harper (1955) states, "The existentialist does want to educate the total man, not just one or another side of him" (p. 223). This statement critiques the idea of the mass-produced, rote process of instruction. What existentialism offers is a way to consider how the relationship between the student and teacher requires that instructors develop a perspective that develops the students' individualised needs and an understanding of the role of responsibility and freedom in the learning process and student-teacher relationship.

Other reactions against previously considered education theories encouraged some to promote existentialism as a beneficial theoretical framework for education. Carole Lieberman (1985) reviewed several approaches, such as *essentialist* and *behaviourist* approaches to teaching, and considered approaches based in existentialism more effective. The essentialist considers ideas based in fostering innate qualities, while the behaviourist views the student as a passive receiver of cultural and historic information. A behaviourist approach also considers that specific cultural influences are to be placed on a child. An essentialist student-teacher relationship is teacher-centered. It is an approach whereby students learn of their culture through a core curriculum. A behaviourist student-teacher relationship has at its center the goal of a change in student behavior through conditioning and response. The existentialist student-teacher relationship prioritizes the instructor as a guide, and the central focus resides on the student.

A voice instructor who considers the student in existentialist terms repositions the roles of the student and the teacher (Lieberman, 1985). Although the teacher is responsible for guiding the student to make connections, the focus still remains on the student and how to facilitate the information to the student in the most effective and individualised way. In an existentialist approach, there is no behavior to change in a student as is evident in the behaviorist approach. Many of the behaviourist approaches represent a student-teacher relationship in which the student is treated as an object, not a subject or an individual capable of an experience. The instructor considering the influence of existentialist principles may feel that a mass approach to education is not a good pedagogical approach (Lieberman, 1985). This has parallels to the teaching practices that may be used in some voice studios, where a teacher has each of her students sing the same rote exercises without addressing the specific needs of each student. This may occur in the scientific, and in some contemporary, approaches to teaching that were discussed in the previous section. A scripted lesson will likely not inspire individual learning or interpretation and may present a challenge for a student to develop consistent singing. Lieberman states, "Existentialists do not want, by advocating equal opportunities for all, mass education, employing assembly line techniques. Mass education is similar to rote learning in vocal instruction. In this approach, the student repeats what she has been taught in the classroom" (p. 325). A student educated in a mass setting is not treated as an individual. A voice student

instructed with the same exercises that everyone else sings is also not treated as an individual. Each singer has specific needs to address to find consistency in singing, and this simply cannot be accomplished by singing scripted exercises. Yet the features criticised in mass education can commonly be found in the practices of vocal instruction. It is not uncommon for voice students to repeat a set of rote exercises without a point of reference. In emphasizing this task, the repetition underemphasises the importance of the singer finding her individuality. Arguably, the rote learning does little to foster consistency in singing or artistic freedom. In order for a student to find her individual sound and consistency in singing, the voice instructor has the responsibility to guide the student as an individual, with specific student-focused or individualised instruction. Lieberman states, "The teacher must guard against fostering his/her own values upon students and must inculcate a feeling of self-reliance in each of them" (p. 324). This view speaks of the idea of instilling responsibility in the student. A voice student who is instructed to be self-reliant is a singer who will find consistency in singing.

In existentialist terms, the student merely exists full of potential. The responsibility and goal of the instructor can be an attempt to find and guide the discovery of the essence of each voice student, starting from the beginning, through effective instruction geared towards each individual. An existentialist environment in a voice studio may inform the student-teacher relationship in ways that encourage consistency in singing, including personal autonomy, independence, and artistic choices or artistic freedom of expressions. This idea may not be present in a studio in which a student is not led towards her individual freedom, such as one using an approach based solely in science, for example. A teaching approach based in science and anatomy appears rigid and without flexibility, and it may not instill consistency in singing or inspire creativity in the student. As well, a student instructed through imagery may not develop a feeling of self-reliance, independence, or autonomy in singing.

Others have explored existentialism as a positive philosophical foundation in education. Using an existentialist approach as a framework, the teacher creates an environment in which the student comes to her own understanding. Martin and Loomis (2007) contend, "No single set of learning outcomes is appropriate for all students" (p. 52). Each student has different needs and must be approached individually to elicit appropriate outcomes. A voice student will have a different set of learning outcomes from each of her classmates. This idea is unlike differentiated instruction, which considers attentiveness to learning. An existentialist framework goes further and considers the notion of fostering responsibility and freedom in vocal instruction, attempting to offer a way for the voice instructor to address the learner (the singer) and to find individual outcomes specific for each student aiding in fostering artistry in singing. Each voice student will develop a different essence as a singer, bringing with her a different tone and emotional experience; therefore, drawing upon existentialist thought and addressing the student as an individual may offer a way to help the student find her essence as a singer. In understanding the role of the teacher and student in existentialism, it is important to understand how responsibility and freedom inform this relationship, and how this may have particular relevance for vocal instructors in higher education. The next section discusses each tenet in detail and considers their application to vocal instruction and the student-teacher relationship.

Responsibility and Freedom in the Student-Teacher Relationship

Responsibility and freedom are interconnected in existentialist thought. One cannot exist without the other. In order to find and explore freedom, one must face responsibility. Certain

distinguishing aspects of responsibility and freedom are important in their application to vocal instruction. The notion of responsibility is viewed differently from the perspective of the student and that of the instructor; each individual has a different role in responsibility in the voice studio. As well, the notion of freedom translates to something different for the student and the instructor. Briefly, freedom from the instructor's perspective is her creation of her essence as instructor. For the student, freedom is also the notion of creating essence, but as well it is exploring freedom in artistic expression. Let me turn first to the notion of responsibility.

Responsibility
In an existential theoretical approach to vocal instruction and, specifically, to the voice student, responsibility is the precursor to exploring artistic freedom. In order to be able to explore and find artistic freedom, the student must first have responsibility for her instrument and an ability to sing consistently and with technical facility. In order for the student to gain and face this responsibility, and to find consistency, she must be instructed by an effective voice instructor, one who is also responsible and who explores freedom in facing her responsibility as a voice instructor. The student also explores a certain level of freedom of choice while engaging in vocal study that, one hopes, will lead to consistency in singing. The student can explore free will to decide whether or not to take on the responsibility of learning to sing correctly. Thus, these principles are both interconnected and distinct from each other. I begin, accordingly, with responsibility.

In existentialist thought, the individual is charged with being responsible for her outcome and what she will become (Sartre, 1984, 2007). This idea will be explored in relation to both student and instructor in this section. For the student, this notion will be explored in terms of the student taking on an active and engaged role in her learning process, in her vocal development. In existentialist thought, the teachers' awareness of responsibility and her accepting it is crucial.

The notion of responsibility for a student means she is charged with determining her own individual outcome (Sartre, 1984, 2001, 2007). In other words, she is a stakeholder in her education, progress, and its eventual outcome (Bowers, 1965; Dhawan, 2005; Morris, 1954). The student in existentialist thought has the ability to determine and control what she will become. In order to find what she will become, she must take an active role in the process of becoming, hold herself accountable, and face her responsibility in the student-teacher relationship in her own learning environment. When considering this idea in the learning environment in a voice studio in higher education, it is important for the student to be aware of and to have responsibility in learning to gain vocal consistency. The student must consider the information being facilitated by her voice instructor and take an engaged role in imprinting the correct way to sing. This requires awareness, commitment, and focus on the part of the student. In this realisation of responsibility, the student becomes aware that the decisions she makes in her course of voice study will determine the type of singer and performer she will become. A student who does not realise or embrace her responsibility may just mindlessly sing exercises in a practice room without focus, learning vocal repertoire on a superficial level. She may never attain consistency in singing or develop the ability to explore artistry. The singer who is not responsible for her own instrument and does not take an active role in the student-teacher relationship will likely continue singing inconsistently. She may not experience a great deal of vocal development.

Awareness of responsibility by the student and acting upon it are necessary in order for her to be able to learn to sing independently and with autonomy. The terms independence and autonomy are related. I believe that consistency in singing is the sum of independence and

autonomy, and is gained through a student's awareness of responsibility. The ability to sing independently is the ability to sing with consistency in a practice room, in a lesson, and in performance with confidence and with no doubt as to how to use one's instrument properly. The independent singer can step out on the stage fully aware of her voice; she has autonomy and complete ownership of her instrument. Autonomy, for a singer, is an ability to be in control of her voice technically and to make decisions in performance. These can be decisions such as how to control and manipulate the voice while singing, how to alter one's resonant singing tone, or how much breath one uses. These autonomic choices are not to be confused with the artistic choices that will be discussed further in the next section.

Consistency can also be considered technical proficiency and facility in singing. With vocal consistency, independence, ownership, or technical proficiency, the singer can make autonomous decisions leading to exploring artistic interpretation. The relationship of responsibility and freedom are connected, they are dependent upon each other. A student cannot experience artistry without taking responsibility for gaining independence and autonomy (consistency) in singing. This awareness of responsibility and the guidance towards consistency that leads the artistry in singing must come from an effective instructor. The next paragraphs explore the role of the teacher in responsibility. In the following paragraphs, I will show how although the role of the student is important in facing responsibility and taking an active role in the learning process, this cannot be accomplished without an effective instructor. The role of the instructor in the student-teacher relationship in the voice studio is crucial. The voice instructor is the guide facing the responsibility of helping the student make connections and find artistry in singing.

A reciprocal relationship occurs in the teacher's awareness of her responsibility in the student-teacher relationship. The teacher is the guide helping the individual or student, in this case, become aware of responsibility, guiding her towards freedom. The instructor's view of the individual, in light of Sartre's views, and her ability to project her outcome may be considered influential in a student-teacher relationship. Burstow (1983) notes:

> Whether the helper be called teacher or therapist, Sartre is asking him to help the human being come to terms with his individual project, accept his freedom and facticity, and emerge as the unique human being that he is. (p. 180)

In this setting, the teacher is the guide. The instructor is there to guide her students to take on responsibility; she is there to help them define their essence and uniqueness, while determining her own outcome as instructor as well. This idea can also be considered in vocal instruction. The instructor acts as the guide for the student to help her face responsibility and find consistency in singing. This guidance comes from an effective voice instructor in a facilitative student-teacher relationship. She is responsible for instructing the student as an individual to find consistency (autonomy and independence) in singing. Patenaude-Yarnell (2003) speaks of guiding the voice student to be responsible: "When a singer is guided into discovering the elements of beautiful singing, rather than always being told how to do it, the results are usually more gratifying" (p. 255). The student who is guided to be responsible for her voice is empowered and more confident. Once independent, she does not need her teacher to make her sing consistently, but rather has the ability to sing well on her own. An effective vocal instructor will strive to bring her students to a level where they no longer need her as a teacher.

A voice instructor who considers an existentialist framework may find she becomes more effective by obtaining an ability to lead her students to independence. She then perhaps can facilitate the type of singing that gives students the opportunity to sing a wider variety of repertoire and the ability to learn music quickly, as they will be able to work more

independently. A view of the voice instructor in an existentialist framework may offer ways to consider instilling responsibility through the use of the existentialist notion of no excuses in the student-teacher relationship. This means making the student aware that she is fully responsible for her own outcome. The instructor is the guide; however, the voice student must work hard and be engaged. The instructor may also wish to consider existentialist thought to encourage the student not to be indifferent to the process of vocal study. Sartre (1984) defines indifference as being a form of blindness: "We are dealing with a kind of blindness with respect to others. I do not suffer this blindness as a state. I *am* my own blindness" (p. 495). The instructor, when viewing vocal instruction through an existentialist lens, may be presented with ways to encourage the student to be engaged in learning and not blind, as Sartre speaks of it, in learning, helping her to face her own responsibility.

Considering the notion of responsibility in an existentialist framework for vocal instruction may present the instructor with an awareness of her role in the student-teacher relationship; that is, her responsibility to guide the student in vocal technique, using as many descriptions or pedagogical approaches as necessary to help the student make a connection to consistent singing. As well, the instructor must assist the student not to feel abandoned or in anguish when facing the responsibility of learning to sing consistently, but rather to view this responsibility positively. The student can be made aware by her instructor that facing responsibility can give her the opportunity to project the essence of the singer that she would like to become. In a student-teacher relationship based in existentialism, the instructor may be presented with ways to convince the student that this responsibility is beneficial and may help the student give better performances, as she will be an independent singer. A student guided to accept responsibility gains consistency—meaning independence and autonomy—which leads to an ability to make choices in artistry. These choices can lead to better and more engaged performances. An emotionally engaged singer is a better performer. This concept will be explored in more detail in the discussion of freedom. I believe that a voice instructor who encourages responsibility and who guides her students to be focused and to be stakeholders in finding vocal consistency (independence and autonomy) is an effective vocal instructor, whereas an instructor who cannot guide her students to responsibility or vocal consistency is not an effective instructor and will instead further the prevalence of inconsistent and unengaged singing.

The parallels of the notion of the instructor being responsible for the student and the offer of individualised instruction as found in existential frameworks for education are notable and may also be considered in vocal instruction. The idea of individualised instruction is also found in humanistic education. Humanistic education is influenced by existentialist principles. Humanistic methods of education emphasize the individual, responsibility, flexibility, facilitation, freedom, individual experience, emotions, guiding discoveries, students' worth, and values. The relationship of student and teacher is the most influential and essential part of a learning environment with the teacher as the guide (Rogers & Freiberg, 1994). In the humanistic relationship, the student is considered responsible and free; in other words, the student has responsibility for her outcome, and an ability to make choices in the relationship where the teacher acts as the guide.

An examination of traits in humanistic education considered effective in instruction shows that a teacher who can facilitate should be real and genuine. "When the facilitator is a real person, being what she is, entering into a relationship with the learner without presenting a front or façade, she is much more likely to be effective" (Rogers & Freiberg, 1994, p. 154). These traits are of particular relevance when facilitating for inexperienced, vulnerable voice students.

The student-teacher relationship in the voice studio must be real and genuine, without pretense. A voice student is quite vulnerable and sensitive; the student is the instrument, so any indication of a lack of genuine and positive intent on the part of the instructor can negatively affect the student's experience and perhaps development. A voice student places her trust in the instructor. The student should feel that her instructor has her best interests in mind and will try every approach necessary to ensure the student learns how to sing well. Sometimes, a teacher may give up and disengage in lessons. Perhaps this teacher is not facing the responsibility she has taken on. It is also possible that the teacher does not have an effective teaching approach to help the student make a connection to the material that she wishes to translate to the student.

Responsibility and the role of the instructor in voice study may be further considered and examined through discussion of the difference between the notions of teaching voice and facilitating voice. If responsibility is central, then there is a clear awareness of the way in which an instructor must position herself in fostering and facilitating this increasing level of responsibility. Rogers and Freiberg (1994) expressed concern about "teachers" as opposed to "facilitators."A teacher, for example, in the voice studio, may offer students just a set of repetitive, scripted rote exercises without connecting how the exercises can help the student find her resonant tone and other elements of consistent singing. A facilitator is the type of instructor who will ensure that students become aware of their resonant tone and all other aspects of singing, using as many exercises, approaches, or examples as necessary while also discussing breath, posture, tension, an emotional connection to the song, and experiencing the song that is being studied. A teaching approach based in existentialist underpinnings may be considered as a way to facilitate learning vocal technique and foster consistent singing, and as a way for the singer to explore artistry. "I cannot stress too strongly how much I wish that someone could wave that magic wand and change teaching to facilitation" (Rogers and Freiberg, p. 171). A student will have an arduous task trying to find her individual sound and consistency in singing unless facilitated or guided by a knowledgeable instructor who understands her responsibility. As well, an instructor who considers the notions of freedom and free will is willing to give her student responsibility in finding consistency in singing. This freedom and facilitation goes far beyond just learning the basic techniques of singing; it also applies to how a singer will eventually interpret a song's text and character when she sings repertoire.

In examining the responsibility of an instructor in facilitating voice in a humanistic environment, one can conclude that a voice instructor offering individualised vocal instruction specific to each students' needs may offer a way to promote more consistency in singing. An individualised, flexible approach may be considered effective in vocal instruction. The student-teacher relationship in the voice studio is a humanistic relationship. It is very much centered on the individual, and her experience, discovery, and emotions. Discovery for a voice student is the discovery of her voice and an awareness of an emotional experience in music. This discovery may happen when a student is instructed as an individual. Bowers (1965) says, "The essence he creates is a product of his choices and will vary from individual to individual" (p. 223). This idea is quite complementary to vocal instruction, the idea of instructing the individual, and the discoveries that can transpire for a student when instructed in this manner.

The student instructed with an individualised focus may discover the possibility of learning to sing consistently, as the focus is on addressing the individual needs of each singer, which may lead to consistency. Many voice instructors may not use an individualised approach. Some may use compartmentalised approaches that appear to not be individualised, such as the scientific, natural, and imagery-based, as well as some contemporary, approaches. A scientific or

contemporary approach, as previously discussed, may rely upon scripted exercises; while a natural approach relies on release of tension, and possibly leaves the student without complete vocal development. Teachers using approaches based in imagery may assist the student in a lesson, but this approach is not individualised in that it fails to offer ways for the student to engage in self-discovery or to find consistency in practicing. A student who has no concrete information upon which to rely in a practice room will find it hard to discover her sound and to gain consistency, independence, and autonomy in singing. These approaches do not appear individualised, but are instead compartmentalized. These pedagogical approaches appear to address just some aspects of singing. They appear to fail at addressing a complete singer and all aspects of what makes a complete singer, and appear to not show effective or responsible instruction. A complete singer is one who is instructed to have consistency in all aspects of singing; not just compartmentalized components such as posture or breath, but all aspects including breath, posture, resonance, lack of tension, and vocal agility. Leading from consistency, the complete singer may then explore musicianship and artistry, and will experience music at a deep emotional level.

It is clear that the student has ownership in responsibility, but is not alone in this responsibility; the instructor helps form the student-teacher relationship in the voice studio and her role is crucial. A reciprocal relationship occurs when the instructor becomes aware of her responsibility. The voice instructor in this relationship is the guide and facilitator of consistent singing. As discussed, consistency in singing is the precursor to be able to explore the idea of freedom that will be discussed in the next section. The student must be guided to sing consistently in all aspect of singing in order to gain independence and autonomy. This facilitation must come from an instructor who has responsibility. This type of instructor is one that is effective, and that has an ability to offer individualized and flexible instruction using a number of approaches necessary to help the student reach a level of consistency in singing.

Many teaching approaches such as those mentioned in this section and previous chapters appear ineffective. In the voice studio, these approaches fall short in offering students an ability to reach a high level of vocal consistency, which consequently limits a student's ability to explore freedom in artistry. Consideration of existentialist principles can present voice instructors with ways to view and reconsider responsibility in their relationships. This individualized, flexible pedagogical approach may help facilitate consistency and emotional engagement in singing, and be a way for both student and teacher to discover what they can become. Attentiveness to the role of responsibility may provide voice instructors with opportunities to consider how they think about students and about inconsistent and unengaged singing. In considering a humanistic relationship in the voice studio, the student-teacher relationship is one in which the instructor is quite important. A voice instructor viewing a humanistic environment with an existentialist framework may reflect and discover that she wishes to obtain teaching tools to facilitate aspects of vocal instruction in an effective manner. The next section will explore the idea of freedom in the student-teacher relationship in the voice studio, offering ways to consider promoting flexible vocal instruction that will lead to consistency and engagement in singing.

Freedom
The guiding principles of freedom in Sartre's existentialist thought center on free will and choice (Sartre, 1984, 2001, 2007). In considering the broader existentialist principle of freedom for this study, I apply the notion of freedom as well to the choices and judgments one makes in artistry

and in physically free singing. I examine the notion of freedom for the voice student first, followed by an examination of freedom for the voice instructor. In considering the notion of freedom for the voice student for this study, I examine several aspects of this principle. My first consideration is the ability to sing physically free. This study also explores free will to define essence. Finally, I consider freedom in artistic choice. This all occurs once the student has gained an ability to sing with consistency. In examining the notion of freedom for the voice instructor in this study, I will consider free will and choice as they may apply to determining the essence of a voice instructor.

For a singer, the body is the instrument; any lack of physical freedom will negatively affect the tone and cause discomfort (Bunch, 1997; Doscher, 1994; & Miller, 1986, 1996, 2004). An inability to sing consistently or freely is disconcerting, and the cause of much stress and feelings of discouragement. However, once the singer has gained consistency and physically free singing, she experiences a sense of freedom, in the sense that she feels released, empowered, and full of possibilities for emotional exploration of music and text. Conversely, the singer who has an ability to sing with consistency is one who has independence and autonomy in singing. Specifically, she has an ability to step out on stage, sing in a practice room, or learn a new piece of music with the self-reliance and confidence that she is using her instrument in a proficient and healthy manner. Once the student has gained this consistency, she has freedom in singing: a physical freedom. This means a relaxed, effortless, released, and free tone. Her body is free and there to act as the instrument, the resonator for the voice without restriction in the tone or tension in the body.

Following the exploration of freedom as the idea of physically free and consistent singing, I also consider the notion of freedom as free will in determining one's essence. When considering the singer and a view of vocal instruction through an existentialist lens, one may wish to consider that the student can determine her essence as a singer and performer. This idea has some parallels to the idea of responsibility, in that the student is a stakeholder. The singer who has been guided to face responsibility with consistency gained in singing now has further options to determine her essence as a singer. In existentialist thought, a person has the freedom to choose her essence and her outcome and what she will become (Sartre, 2007). This idea may also be considered in a view of voice study and the student. The singer has the ability to determine her essence, the type of singer she will be. In existentialist thought, one's essence is not predetermined. Considering the voice student in existentialist terms, the singer and her voice merely exist, and the exploration of freedom and free will may help the singer determine her essence; that is, the essence of her tone and her emotional experience in music. This is what is to be discovered and created by the singer. The student is free to explore her unique sound and the possibilities of how she can develop it even further once she has gained independence and consistency in singing. This idea may present a view of the possibilities of what the student can become. Bowers (1965) states, "The essence he creates is a product of his choices" (p. 223). This statement refers to free will and choice in existentialist thought. In existentialist thought, the individual determines her essence through free will, through choice, and by deciding her own outcome. She has a say in determining the type of individual she will become. The individual is in control of her outcome, which is the sum of her choices. When considering this idea for the voice student, these choices are not predetermined, as the individual singer decides and creates her essence. The singer has the ability to decide if she will become a consistent singer or not and can be a part of the process of becoming one. As well, once she reaches a level of consistency, the choices she makes in performance and interpretation of music determine the type of artist she

will be. These choices in performance are often spontaneous and are therefore individual and not pre-determined. The sum of these choices creates the essence of a singer.

Perhaps the most important examination of freedom when considering the voice student in existentialist terms is the idea of artistic freedom, and the consequent creative possibilities to sing consistently. The independent, autonomous, and technically proficient singer has vast possibilities in her exploration of artistic freedom. The possibilities will vary from student to student, as no voice is the same as another. No emotional experience that a singer brings to a piece of music is the same as another. The voice student may consider an exploration of freedom as a way to consider expressive ideas in performance. For example, she may consider the use of expressive ideas, such as dynamic coloring for emotional effect, tempo variation, facial expression, body language, and expressive use of pronunciation and diction.

A singer who is able to explore her freedom through an individual and expressive interpretation of a piece of vocal music is more engaging to hear and see for an audience member. This idea can be explained further with the comparison between a singer on stage who is technically proficient, but does not explore freedom and lacks emotional engagement, and a singer who is proficient and also explores freedom. In the latter case, the singer tends to be more expressive and thus more engaging to watch perform. There is a great deal of difference in these two singers. Someone who appears to have no focus or emotion in her eyes can be considered a "deer in the headlights" on stage. She may sing with technical facility but is un-engaging and expressionless. A further analogy to illustrate this idea of lack of engagement is suggested by the manner in which one might lecture to a class or present a paper in a conference. A lecturer or speaker may have a great deal of knowledge or facility in the material; however, if she speaks in a low, timid voice without inflection, lacks eye contact with her audience, and appears uncomfortable, this person is not engaging her audience. The audience's reaction to this person may be boredom. A similar reaction may also occur while watching an un-engaging or expressionless singer.

Existentialism presents the teacher with a chance to look at herself as an instructor, to examine free will, and to make the decision to be a stakeholder responsible for helping each voice student uniquely. This concept parallels the idea of free will in relation to the student in that it also involves the idea of responsibility and being a stakeholder in the process. [x]As previously mentioned, some aspects of responsibility and freedom are interconnected and some aspects are distinct. No student is the same, nor does one have the same vocal issues to address as another. The voice instructor may consider the idea of essence as an opportunity to make choices that determine her outcome as a teacher. Morris (1954) remarks, "The way to the good life, or as the existentialist would put it, the authentic life, is for each individual human being to begin realising himself by asserting his individuality and making his own choices…" (p. 257). The voice instructor can make choices to determine her essence and perhaps choose if she wishes to be an effective facilitator of vocal technique who may lead her students to find consistency in singing. She may choose to facilitate her students to become independent and autonomous singers who can explore artistic freedom in performance.

In addition to freedom of choice and free will in determining essence, the voice instructor is also presented with freedom of choice in deciding what pedagogical approaches may lead to more consistent singing for her students. As each student is unique, the vocal instructor has available to her any number of approaches that may facilitate consistency and thus guide students towards their artistic freedom. Existentialism and the notions of free will do not prescribe one particular approach, but rather suggest attentiveness to the particular individuals' needs by

considering the various options and approaches by an instructor. In this way, the existentialist vocal instructor cannot be complacent in her practices but, rather "encourages individual creativity and imagination more than copying and imitating established models" (Nayak and Rao, 2008, p. 16). Each student's voice is individual and like a fingerprint. It would be beneficial for a voice teacher to have an effective way to approach each student to discover this individuality and facilitate consistency, leading the student to artistic freedom and emotional engagement in singing.

An existentialist approach does not advocate a natural (do nothing) approach, or an "anything goes" approach to vocal instruction. Rather, it is a way to consider an effective teacher who is proficient in various approaches of vocal instruction. With this facility, the instructor can explore freedom in the student-teacher relationship to choose to facilitate instruction for her students depending on the specific needs that are presented in lessons. The voice student can present a unique challenge for a voice instructor, as compared to other instrumental instructors. The voice student's body is the instrument, with the potential of having any number of technical issues change in weekly lessons or in student performances. The student is not an inanimate object such as a piano or cello. For example, singers can develop illness or develop postural issues that affect vocal tone. New tensions may arise in the body, affecting breath, throat construction, or an ability to sing with resonance; or other unexpected changes may occur. For example, if a student presents herself in a weekly lesson with a great deal of physical tension, perhaps the instructor can consider exploring freedom in choosing one of the contemporary approaches to facilitate release of tension and more grounded breath in the body. Perhaps the next week, the same student may not be able to access a resonant singing tone and, in this case, the instructor may wish to choose a more scientific approach to illustrate how the voice functions, and to present ways to mitigate this difficulty in finding her resonant singing tone. Perhaps this same individual, once she has reconnected with her resonant singing tone in the lesson cannot emotionally connect to the song she is studying. This may be a time for the instructor to use freedom to choose imagery and imagination to help the student find meaning in the song text, thus helping her make an emotional connection. In an existentialist framework, the exploration of freedom and choice may be effective in facilitating consistency and emotional engagement in students. An existentialist framework requires that instructors draw upon a number of approaches to guide the student through any technical issues presented.

Creating and facilitating an environment in the student-teacher relationship based in freedom is considered beneficial in arts education (Greene, 1973, 1995; & Naples, 1971). Naples (1971) says, "Existentialism urges educators to adopt an attitude of openness and freedom in the classroom that is appropriate to an arts program aimed at developing aesthetic sensitivity" (p. 29). This existentialist view can also be presented for consideration in the higher education voice studio. A voice instructor who is willing to explore her freedom may discover that in using an existentialist framework for instruction she can foster an open and creative environment in the studio, one which may help inspire the student to explore the possibilities of aesthetic sensitivity. This idea of aesthetic sensitivity can be defined in vocal study as an emotional connection, an awareness of and a new sensitivity towards music and text.

In this light, the instructor can be viewed as one who can also present a new and fresh view of music and give this to her students. According to Greene (1973), "The teacher must personally intend to bring about certain changes in students' outlooks; he must mean to enable them to perform in particular ways, to do particular tasks, to impose increasingly complex orders upon their world" (p. 70). The voice instructor considering an existentialist framework is presented

with the opportunity to make a commitment to bring about a change in outlook such as Greene (1973) speaks of, in order to help students realise what they can become as singers.

Learning how to sing consistently is arduous, but necessary and a precursor to being able to unlock the free artist within. Greene (1995) describes the essential role of the teacher: "Surely, nothing can be more important than finding the source of learning, not in extrinsic demand, but in human freedom" (p. 132). The ability to find ones' individual singing tone or consistency in singing is not inherent; it is not an ability that naturally exists. It must be discovered by the student, guided by an effective voice instructor through an exploration of freedom.

An existentialist framework for vocal instruction, such as that considered in this research study, may offer the instructor and student a glimpse of the possibilities. Greene declares, "Art offers life; it offers hope; it offers the prospect of discovery; it offers light" (1995, p. 133). A voice instructor may have the opportunity to define her essence as a facilitator of voice study and to possibly alter her facticity as an instructor. If many of her students are unable to sing with consistency and an emotional connection, perhaps self-reflection and a way to reconsider her teaching approach, such as that offered in an existentialist framework, may alter this facticity. I believe using an existentialist approach for vocal instruction may discern ways to help a student discover hope, art, and an artistic and emotional experience in singing.

Conclusions of Existentialism and Education

Existentialism has informed education practice to offer alternative ways of considering the student as an individual. It provides a view of the student-teacher relationship that strives to inspire individuality and responsibility in learning, leading to students who have independence, autonomy, and an ability to choose and find freedom. The key principles that underpin existentialism and its application to education are: instructing the individual with flexibility, making the student aware of free will and responsibility, while at the same time helping the student face feelings of abandonment and anguish. A student-teacher relationship based in existentialism offers the ability for both teacher and student to find each one's essence. It puts the individual in charge of what she will become. It offers choice for both teacher and student. The teacher can choose to find her essence as a teacher. Existentialism offers the ability of choice; a teacher does not have to feel trapped in using just one teaching approach or one way of approaching students. Free will can be used to give the teacher an opportunity to choose from a variety of teaching tools to help address the individual student.

These existentialist ideas may also be considered in re-conceptualizing the student-teacher relationship in the voice studio and may inform vocal pedagogy practice. A voice instructor may consider such Sartrean principles as freedom, free will, choice, and responsibility, and may have the opportunity to help student mitigate inconsistency in singing. If a teacher has an acute awareness of her responsibility, combined with knowledge of many pedagogical approaches to vocal instruction geared towards teaching the individual, using her free will to choose an approach can perhaps provide a way to mitigate inconsistency in her students. Once a student has gained an awareness of how to sing consistently, she has independence and autonomy, and may have an ability to use her free will to make individual artistic choices in interpreting music. One that is not distracted by inconsistent singing has a world of possibilities in front of her. The aim is for voice students to become engaged in a piece of music and make unique choices that are expressive of themselves. The voice teacher using an existentialist framework for instructing has

an opportunity to create her essence as a teacher, and to become the type of teacher that has students that are able to give consistent, artistic and free performances.

Identification of Themes and Generated in the Study: Introduction of Themes

Introduction

The purpose of my research was to develop a deeper understanding of the student-teacher relationship and to consider ways that pedagogues can facilitate more consistent and emotional singing and further, can explore their own essence as voice instructors. This study explored ways to attempt to mitigate these issues through a student-teacher relationship influenced by the existentialist principles of Sartre as a way to consider vocal instruction holistically or, in other words, instruct the voice student in all aspects of singing. It describes a complete approach that attempts to address all elements of obtaining consistency in singing as well as addressing the mind, emotions, and experience of the student to facilitate emotional engagement.

In the study, I examined my student-teacher relationships in the voice studio with the specific intent of considering how Sartre's principles of responsibility and freedom may help to mitigate inconsistency and a lack of emotional engagement in voice students in higher education. As I aimed to foster students' increasing sense of their own responsibility and freedom as vocalists, the process highlighted emerging themes: awareness, resistance, fear, acceptance, and becoming. In the following sections, I will clarify how Sartre's view of the human condition helped influence my teaching approach and led students to find more responsibility and freedom in vocal development with an improvement in vocal consistency and an ability to engage emotionally with music and text.

Summary of the Conclusions of the Themes

Upon reviewing reflective and video information from the students lived experience, as well as my own experience in this study, I was able to draw some conclusions based on my research question:

> To what extent can Jean-Paul Sartre's existentialist principles of responsibility and freedom suitably influence the student-teacher relationship and be applied to vocal development to improve inconsistent and emotionally unengaged singing in undergraduate music students?

The revelation and interpretation of the themes that emerged may offer ways for a vocal instructor to consider ways to become more effective. She may wish to attempt to create a humanistic teaching environment with an existentialist framework that complements how she already instructs. I believe that an instructor who faces her responsibility, one who instills it in her students, and who strives to find her own freedom as well as guiding students to theirs, may mitigate inconsistency and lack of engagement in today's voice students.

When instructed with this teaching approach influenced by Sartre's principles, the students faced responsibility and found improved consistency in singing. They emerged more independent and autonomous. Each student experienced this consistency at various depths, and each found improved development. As well, each student noted the discovery of aspects of individual freedom. Aspects of freedom that emerged from this study were an awareness of physical freedom in singing and a way to release the body and mind. Each student also experienced a profound change in artistic freedom and an awareness of her ability to determine her essence through free will and choice. As each student embraced responsibility, she found

more consistency, as Sartre's principles influenced the teaching approach. With this consistency, the students were able to find meaning in their music. They improved their ability to explore emotions and to find ways to make personal interpretations through considering freedom in artistry in their music; thus, each created an aesthetic experience in performance for both the student and her audience.

I believe this teaching approach influenced by Sartre's principles may create ways to reposition how instructors view their role in their student-teacher relationships in the voice studio and may complement approaches they are already using. As well, it may be considered for use in helping a voice instructor foster better and more consistent singing and emotional engagement in her students. This study presented ways to show instructors how to approach the facilitation of voice and offered a view of both the student's and the instructor's phenomenological experience in using this approach. This occurred through considering each student in existentialist terms as a blank slate and as an individual, by offering instruction based on the exploration of responsibility and freedom, and by addressing the student's specific needs to help improve consistency. This instruction was facilitated in a humanistic manner in which I, while being responsible, explored freedom to draw upon numerous teaching approaches described in the review of pedagogical approaches in this study. I believe this approach based in existentialist thought was holistic, in that it addressed all aspects of the student, the body, mind, spirit, and experience it was, as well, a holistic approach for me as the instructor, given that was conscious of the same aspects.

As I taught the students, I effectively addressed the body using varied approaches that led to improved consistency in singing. I instructed the mind, both by instilling responsibility and in developing the consciousness and awareness of how to sing correctly with consistency. I guided them to open their minds to freedom and to explore how freedom informed their singing, thus enhancing their experience in singing. I believe that the possibilities of exploration of freedom and what they can become in artistic interpretations can be endless for a singer using this approach. With freedom and consistency in singing, the student can experience a new interpretation of a song each time she sings it. She is completely free to determine her own essence and what she can become. As well, the study served to give instructors consideration of what they can become, and to reflect upon ways to be more effective in their student-teacher relationships in higher education. I consider that "pedagogy is something that a parent or teacher continuously must redeem, retrieve, regain, recapture in the sense of recalling" (van Manen, 1990, p. 149). It is important that vocal pedagogues continue to strive to facilitate voice students in a way that fosters artistry. This can be accomplished through self-reflection, by recapturing ways to address the complete singer to foster artistic performances, and through a continued passion for the performing arts in higher education voice students.

Final Conclusions of the Study

Implications for Higher Education

My phenomenological experience, both as researcher and instructor, was quite significant in this study. In my review, reflection, and hermeneutic interpretation of the materials of the lived experience during the research study, I was quite conscious and acutely aware of the notion of teaching versus facilitation. As I was not only the researcher but the teacher as well, this study presented a way to reflect, reconsider, and reposition my role in the student-teacher relationship. Van Manen (1990) declares, "I am not *just* a researcher who observes life, I am also a parent and a teacher who stands pedagogically in life" (p. 90). This statement was quite appropriate for my

research study. As a vocal pedagogue, my care and concern is for the outcome of the students. The need for my study stemmed from a prevalence of inconsistent and unengaged singing. I believe the root of this problem stems from educators' approach to instruction. This study offered an opening to consider how instruction might look different when viewed through the lens of the principles of existentialism. As I experienced the study, I reflected upon my role as instructor and facilitator, and searched for ways to be effective for my students in helping them mitigate issues of inconsistency and lack of emotion. In my interpretation of the student materials and my own experience, I considered my research question and how suitable Sartre's principles of responsibility and freedom were in influencing the student-teacher relationship and the students' vocal development. My own interpretation, as well as asking the students reflective questions or giving them prompts during the course of the study, gave me the opportunity to examine and to be flexible in my teaching approach, and it enabled me to make adjustments by considering both Sartre's principles and a humanistic approach to instruction.

This study offered ways to redefine and recast my teaching approach and skill set as an instructor through the influence of Sartre's principles. I considered Sartre's (2007) thoughts: "Life itself is nothing until it is lived. It is we who give it meaning, and value is nothing more than meaning that we give it" (p. 51). I interpreted these words to mean that I was responsible for helping students understand what it means to sing consistently and with emotions. In so doing, I searched for ways to instill responsibility and to guide them to explore all aspects of their freedom as artists.

This idea also speaks to the notion of free will and essence. Once a student establishes responsibility in vocal development, she gives it meaning. The essence of the meaning is for the student to determine. The meaning and value she gives her vocal study and performance determines her essence and the outcome of what she will become. The instructor gives meaning to the students in leading them to discoveries. She also has the opportunity in an existentialist framework to give meaning and to determine her essence as an instructor. For both the student and instructor, the outcome will be what they put into the process of becoming.

I explored my freedom as instructor by embracing an ability to use my free will. In using my free will, I was able to choose from a varied skill set and a variety of approaches to incorporate any number of the approaches described in the earlier part of this study. I was not restricted by only having knowledge in a compartmentalised use of one approach. I had the freedom to draw from many and to use them depending on the individual needs of the student. This freedom was not an "anything goes" or "natural" approach. It was very much based in an acute awareness of the needs of the students and the mitigating issues that arose for each student, having initially viewed them in Sartrean terms as a blank slate. In this sense, it was an approach based in responsibility and freedom, and yet prescriptive in that when a student presented a problem, I explored my freedom to draw upon numerous approaches to help guide her to the solution. I believe my students experienced very effective instruction with improved consistency and emotional engagement in being instructed with a teaching approach grounded in existentialist thought.

Existentialism complements the existing approaches to vocal instruction that are already in practice in higher education. I am not discounting the approaches that are commonly used; but rather, I wish to shift the emphasis to an awareness of responsibility and freedom, while still being attentive to a range of approaches that would be appropriate for use in vocal instruction, depending on the individual student. One may use the notion of freedom to break free from a rigid idea of instruction or the use of just one approach. Instructors no longer have to teach as

they were taught; they have the freedom to choose from any number of approaches that will facilitate their students' discovery of aspects of freedom in singing.

Existentialism repositions the view of the student-teacher relationships with the assumption and acknowledgement that one already possesses or requires the disciplinary expertise to instruct using myriad approaches. There is a heightened expectation that one knows various approaches to instruction. In repositioning one's view of vocal instruction with the consideration of existentialist principles, the recommendation for the instructor is to reconsider how best an exploration of freedom in various approaches will attend to the diverse needs of the students. Thus, this study does not indicate or recommend that one can only be an effective vocal instructor by drawing upon existentialist principles; rather, the existentialist principles provides a particular emphasis on responsibility and freedom in the student-teacher relationship.

Final Thoughts

This research study aimed to provide the foundation for a view of the student-teacher relationship based in a theoretical framework influenced by the existentialist principles of Jean-Paul Sartre. The teaching approach considered in this study was not a prescribed method for vocal instructors, but rather offered an approach or way to reconsider or reposition the student-teacher relationship in the voice studio. The approach emphasized both an acceptance of responsibility and a respect for and exploration of freedom in the student-teacher relationship in the voice studio. It highlighted the importance of both responsibility and freedom in teaching relationships.

In this study, and as a philosophical framework for vocal instruction, the notion of responsibility was identified as the precursor to the ability to release oneself to explore and find freedom. The instructor must initially take on the responsibility to instruct her student in the most individualised way, using any number of approaches necessary to ensure that the student reaches a level of consistency in singing and develops a sense of independence and autonomy. As I discovered, the notion of responsibility presented a challenge for some of the students in this study. Sartre's (2007) idea that one is ultimately responsible for one's outcome elicited a reaction or experience of resistance with feelings of fear and anguish for some students. Is important for instructors considering this framework to consider this reaction, and be prepared to encounter these reactions both in their students and in themselves.

The existentialist principle of freedom as described by Sartre (1984, 2001, 2007) gave me, as the instructor, a means by which to help guide the students in this study. By exploring my freedom in our student-teacher relationship in Sartrean terms, I was able to draw upon any number of the teaching approaches reviewed in this study and use them to help the students find more consistency in singing. The influence of the principles guided my own exploration of freedom and free will, and gave me the opportunity not to be locked into using just one approach, as that might not have addressed the individual needs of the students in this study. This realization gave me ways to become more effective for the students, and it influenced the way I interacted with the students. As well, the influence of Sartre's ideas on freedom to determine essence also gave me a way to reflect upon myself as the facilitator in this relationship. It gave me a means to view myself through an existentialist lens, to see that I could, in fact, determine my essence as an instructor of voice. This ability to define the effectiveness of my instruction through the influence of existentialism was of great benefit to the students, as I was to decide

what type of facilitator I wished to me and take steps towards becoming the type of instructor that guides consistency and emotional engagement in my voice students.

Sartre's notion of freedom also influenced the students in this relationship. Once they were able to accept responsibility in our student-teacher relationship, they were more open to the possibilities of what they could become as singers. They were given a way to view themselves as consistent and emotionally engaged artists and were empowered to take steps on the path to becoming that type of singer and performer. The students found a sense of physical freedom in singing, and they had the experience of free will in determining their essence as singers. They also experienced freedom in the experience of discovering the endless possibilities of interpretation in music and text. There was no prescribed way to interpret a song or text; they were exposed to the freedom to decide how to be unique and individual in their performances. An exploration of freedom gave the students a view of what they could become as singers and released them to experiment and to take risks in performance by exploring individual interpretations of their music and texts. With improved vocal consistency in place, the students were opened up to an exploration of freedom that helped them become more emotionally engaged singers. They gained a sense of what they could become through the influence of existentialist principles in the voice studio and a view of themselves as the channel through which the composers' word and music could be individually expressed in the art of singing.

References

Acadia University (2013). School of Music. Retrieved from http://music.acadiau.ca/

Alchemy of Singing (2013). Retrieved from http://www.aosinging.com/home.html

Alderson, R. (1979). *Complete handbook of voice training*. West Nyack, NY: Parker Publishing.

Alexander, F. M. (2001). *The use of the self*. London: Orion Publishing. (Original work published 1932).

Appelman, D. R. (1974). *The science of vocal pedagogy.* Bloomington: Indiana University Press. (Original work published 1967).

Barnes, H. (1973). *Sartre*. New York: Lippincott.

Barnes-Burrow, K., Lan, W., Edwards, E., & Archambeault, N. (2008). Current attitudes toward voice studio teaching technology: A bicoastal survey of classical signing pedagogues. *Journal of Voice, 22*(5), 590-602.

Baylor University (2013). School of Music. Retrieved from http://www.baylor.edu/music/

Berklee College of Music (2013). Retrieved from http://www.berklee.edu/

Blades-Zeller, E. (2003). *A spectrum of voices: Prominent American voice teachers discuss the teaching of singing*. Lanham, MD: Scarecrow Press.

Boston Conservatory (2013). Vocal Pedagogy. Retrieved from http://www.bostonconservatory.edu/music/vocal-pedagogy

Brennan, R., (2004). *The Alexander Technique manual: Take control of your life and posture*. London: Connections Book Publishing.

Brighouse, H., & Swift, A. (2006). Equality, priority, and positional goods. *Ethics 116*(3), 471-497.

Broudy, H. S. (1971). Sartre's existentialism and education. *Educational Theory*, *21*(2), 155–177.

Brown, C. A. (2000). *A humane approach to private piano instruction: An analysis and application of the ideas of Abraham Maslow, Carl Rogers, and Jerome Bruner.* Retrieved from ProQuest Digital Dissertations. (UMI 3045990)

Brunk, A. (2008). The private studio: Managing voice problems in the private studio. *Journal of Singing, 64*(5), 615-618.

Bruser, M. (2011). Making music. In B. Boyce & the Shambhala Sun (Eds.), *The mindfulness Revolution: Leading psychologists, scientists, artists, and meditation teachers on the power of mindfulness in daily life* (106-112). Boston: Shambhala Publications.

Bunch, M. (1997). *Dynamics of the singing voice*. Vienna; New York: Springer-Verlag.

Bunch Dayme, M. (2005). *The performer's voice: Realizing your vocal potential*. New York: W.W. Norton.

Bunch Dayme, M. (2006). An argument for whole body and holistic approaches to research in singing. *Journal of Singing, 63*(1), 59-64.

Burger, J. (2011). *Personality*. (8th ed.). Belmont, CA: Wadsworth.

Burstow, B. (1983). Sartre: A possible foundation for educational theory. *Journal of Philosophy of Education, 17*(2), 171-185.

Caccini, G. (2009). *Le nuove musiche* (2nd ed.) H. W. Hitchcock (Ed.). Middleton, WI: A-R Editions. (Original work published 1601).

Callaghan, J. (2000). *Singing and voice science*. San Diego, CA: Singular Publishing Group.

Callaghan, J., & Wilson, P. (2004). *How to see and sing: Singing pedagogy in the digital era*. Surry Hills, NSW: Cantare Systems.

Camden County College (2013). Retrieved from http://www.camdencc.edu/

Caruso, E., & Tetrazzini, L. (1975). *Caruso and Tetrazzini on the art of singing*. New York and London: Dover Publications. (Original work published 1909).

Clements, J. F. (2008). *The use of imagery in teaching voice to the twenty-first century student.* Retrieved from ProQuest Digital Dissertations. (UMI 3321469)

Cleveland, T. (1994). A clearer picture of singing voice production: 25 years of progress. *Journal of Voice, 8*(1), 18-23.

Cobb-Jordan, A. (2001). The study of English, French, German and Italian techniques of singing related to the female adolescent voice. Retrieved from ProQuest Digital Dissertations. (UMI Number 1409833)

Cole, A. (2011). Choosing the best approach for vocal pedagogy. Retrieved from http://www.acole.net/downloadable_works-65.html

Dalhousie University (2013). Department of Music. Retrieved from http://www.dal.ca/faculty/arts/school-of-performing-arts/music.html

David, M. (1995). *The new voice pedagogy* (2nd ed.). Lanham, MD: Scarecrow Press.

Deere, J. D. (2002). Surveying and relating approaches and styles in the pedagogy of singing among voice teachers in six southeastern states. Retrieved from ProQuest Digital Dissertations. (UMI 3049155)

Deere, J. D. (2005). *Singing in the 20th century: A recollection of performance & pedagogy*. Bloomington, IN: AuthorHouse.

Degenhardt, M. A. B., (1975). Sartre, imagination and education. *Journal of Philosophy of Education, 9*(1), 72-92.

Denver Center for Performing Arts (2013). Retrieved from http://www.denvercenter.org/home.aspx

Deva, J. (1994). *The contemporary vocalist improvement course*. Sunland, CA: Jeannie Deva Enterprises.

Doscher, B. (1994). *The functional unity of the singing voice*. Lanham, MD: Scarecrow Press.

Dublin Institute of Technology (2013). Retrieved from http://www.dit.ie/conservatory/

Dufault, J. E. (2008). *Three exemplary voice teachers: David Adams, Stephen King, & Patricia Misslin: Their philosophies & studio techniques.* Retrieved from ProQuest Digital Dissertations. (UMI 3328303)

Earnshaw, S. (2006). *Existentialism: A guide for the perplexed*. London: Continuum International Publishing Group.

Eastman School of Music (2013). Retrieved from http://www.esm.rochester.edu/

Eberle, K. (2003). Enhancing voice teaching with technology. *Journal of Singing, 59*(3), 241-246.

Edwin, R. (2011). Pedagogic pears: Exploring vocal resonance. *Journal of Singing*, *68*(2), 193-194.

Elliott, D. (1995). *Music matters*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Elliott, M. (2007). *Singing in style: A guide to vocal performance practices*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.

Elliot, M, (2010). Singing and mindfulness. *Journal of Singing, 67*(1), 35-40.

Epps, J., Smith, J. R., & Wolfe, J. (1997). A novel instrument to measure acoustic resonances of the vocal tract during phonation. *Measurement Science and Technology, 8*(10), 1112–1121.

Feldenkrais, M. (1990*). Awareness through movement: health exercises for personal growth*. London: Arkana. (Original work published 1972).

Feldenkrais, M. (2002). *The potent self: a study of spontaneity and compulsion*. Berkeley, CA: North Atlantic Books. (Original work published 1985).

Fields, V. A. (1947). *Training the singing voice. An analysis of the working concepts contained in recent contributions to vocal pedagogy*. Morningside Heights, NY: King's Crown Press.

Fields, V. A. (1970). Review of the literature on vocal registers. *NATS Bulletin, 26*, 6-7.

Flick, U. (2009). *An introduction to qualitative research* (4th ed.). London: Sage Publications.

Flynn, T. (2006). *Existentialism: A very short introduction*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Folsom, R. L. (2011). The undergraduate pedagogy experience: Communication through academic freedom. *Journal of Singing*, *67*(4), 403-407.

Foster, D. L. (1971). Existentialism and music education. *Music Journal, 29*(7), 39, 77.

Frederick, T. (2006). Hoarseness: The top causes and how to avoid it. *Canadian Musician, 28*(5), p. 32.

Glaros, P. (2006). Technology in the private studio: A never ending story. *Journal of Singing, 62*(5), 567-572.

Gray, S. (2000). Cellular physiology of the vocal folds. *Otolaryngologic Clinics of North America, 33*(4), 679-697.

Greene, M. (1973). *Teacher as stranger*. Belmont, CA: Wadsworth..

Greene, M. (1978). Teaching: The question of personal reality. *Teachers College Record*, *80*(1), 23-35.

Greene, M. (1983). How I came to phenomenology. *Phenomenology + Pedagogy, 1*(1), 3-4.

Greene, M. (1991). Aesthetic literacy. In R. Smith & A. Simpson (Eds.), *Aesthetics and arts education* (149-161). Chicago: University of Illinois Press.

Greene, M. (1995). *Releasing the imagination. Essays on education, the arts, and social change*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Gregg, J. W. (2001). Resonation and articulation - a new concept. *Journal of Singing*, *58*(2), 167-169.

Greschner, D. (2007). Review of The naked voice: A wholistic approach to singing. *Journal of Singing, 64*(2), 239-242.

Guildhall School of Music and Drama (2013). Retrieved from http://www.gsmd.ac.uk/

Harer, J., & Munden, S. (2009). *The Alexander Technique resource book: A reference guide*. Lanham, MD: Scarecrow Press.

Harper, R. (1955). Significance of existence and recognition for education. In N. Henry (Ed.), *Modern philosophies and education* (215-258). Chicago: University of Illinois Press.

Helding, L. (2012). Mindful voice: Science and art and true grit. *Journal of Singing, 69*(1), 67-73.

Hines, J. (1982). *Great singers on great singing.* New York: Doubleday.

Holland, R. J. (2008). *National schools of singing and their impact on teaching vocal pedagogy and literature*. 17th Annual Convention of the Global Awareness Society International, May 2008, San Francisco, CA.

Honda, K, Hirai, H, Estill, J., & Takhura, Y (1994). Contribution of vocal tract shape to voice quality: MRI data and articulatory modeling. In O. Fujimura and M. Hirano (Eds.), *Vocal fold physiology: voice quality control*. San Diego: Singular Publishing.

Indiana University (2013). Department of music. Retrieved from http://music.indiana.edu/

International Feldenkrais Federation (2013). Retrieved from http://feldenkrais-method.org/en

Joliveau, E., Smith, J., & Wolfec, J. (2004). Vocal tract resonance in singing: The soprano voice. *Journal of the Acoustical Society of America, 116*(4), 2434-2439.

Jones, F. P. (1997). *Freedom to change: The development and science of the Alexander Technique*. London: Mouritz.

Kansas University (2013). Vocal Pedagogy. Retrieved from http://web.ku.edu/~cmed/chovoped/chovopeddoc.html

Kirkpatrick, A., & McLester, J. R. (2012). Teaching lower laryngeal position with EMG biofeedback. *Journal of Singing, 68*(3), 253-260.

Kmucha, S., Yanagisawa, E., & Estill, J. (1990). Endolaryngeal changes during high-intensity phonation videolaryngoscopic observations. *Journal of Voice, 4*(4), 346-354.

Kneller, G. F. (1958). *Existentialism and education.* New York: Philosophical Library.

Lamperti, F. (1980). *The art of singing*. (J. C. Griffith Rev. and Trans.). New York: Schirmer. (Original work published 1890).

Lamperti, G. B., (2009). *G. B. Lamperti: The technics of bel canto. G.* Blankenbehler, (Ed.). United States: Pitch Perfect Publishing Company. (Original work published 1905).

Lehmann, L. (1993). *How to sing.* Mineola, NY: Dover Publications. (Original work published 1924).

Lieberman, C. (1985). The existentialist "school" of thought: Existentialism and education. *The Clearing House, 58*(7), 322-326.

Linsenbard, G. (2010). *Starting with Sartre*. London: Continuum International.

Manchester School of Music (2013). Retrieved from http://www.manchesteracademy.net/

Manhattan School of Music (2013). Vocal Pedagogy. Retrieved from http://www.msmnyc.edu/Instruction-Faculty/Outreach

Manifold, L. (2008) Vocal pedagogy: How the application of breath and body management techniques improves the sound of singers. Retrieved from http://www.manifoldmelodies.com/docs/Manifold_breathing.pdf

Mannes College of Music (2013). Retrieved from http://www.newschool.edu/mannes/

Marchesi, M. (1970). *Bel canto: A theoretical and practical vocal method.* New York: Dover. (Original work published 1898).

Marino, G. (2004). *Basic writings in existentialism*. New York: Modern Library.

Mars Hill College (2013). Department of Music. Retrieved from http://www.mhc.edu/music

Martin D., & Loomis, K. (2007). *Building teachers: A constructivist approach to introducing education*. Belmont CA: Thomson Wadsworth.

Martyna, W. (1978). What does 'he' mean? Use of the generic masculine. *Journal of Communication, 28*(1), 131-138.

Martyna, W. (1980). Beyond the he/man approach: The case for non-sexist language. *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society, 5*(3), 482-493.

Mathis, D. (2009). *Melodic sculpting: The art and science of singing*. Bloomington, IN: Author House.

McGill University (2013). Vocal Pedagogy. Retrieved from http://www.mcgill.ca/study/2011-2012/faculties/music/graduate/programs/master-music-mmus-performance-vocal-pedagogy-thesis

McKinney, J. (1994). *The diagnosis and correction of vocal faults: A manual for teachers of singing and for choir directors.* Long Grove, IL: Waveland Press.

McPherson, G. (Ed.). (2002). *The science and psychology of music performance*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Michael, D. G. (2011). Voice pedagogy: Dispelling vocal myths. Part 2: "Sing it off the chords!" *Journal of Singing*, *7*(4), 417-421.

Miller, D. G. (2008). *Resonance in singing: Voice building through acoustic feedback*. Princeton: Inside View Press.

Miller, J. P. (2007). *The holistic curriculum*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

Miller, R. (1977). *English, French, German and Italian techniques of singing: A study in national tonal preferences and how they relate to functional efficiency*. Lanham, MD: Scarecrow Press.

Miller, R. (1986). *The structure of singing. System and art in vocal technique*. New York: Schirmer Books.

Miller, R. (1996). *On the art of singing.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Miller, R. (1997). *National schools of singing: English, French, German and Italian techniques of signing revisited*. Lanham, MD: Scarecrow Press.

Miller, R. (2003). (1) The unique teacher; (2) Holistic singing. *Journal of Singing, 59*(4), 317-318.

Miller, R. (2004). *Solutions for singers: Tools for performers and teachers*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Miller, R. (2008). *Securing baritone, bass-baritone, and bass voices*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Monahan, B. J. (1978). *The art of singing: A compendium of thoughts on singing published between 1777 and 1927*. Metuchen, NJ: Scarecrow Press.

Morgan, L. (2010). *Inside yourself: A new way to health based on the Alexander Technique*. (2nd ed.). London: Mouritz.

Morris, V. C. (1954). Existentialism and education. *Educational Theory*, *4*(4), 247-258.

Morris, V. C. (1961). Existentialism and the education of the twentieth century man. *Educational Theory*, *11*(1), 52-60.

Mortyakova, J. V. (2009). *Existential piano teacher: The application of Jean-Paul Sartre's philosophy to piano instruction in a higher educational setting*. Retrieved from ProQuest Digital Dissertations. (UMI 3358229)

Motherwell College (2013). Retrieved from http://www.motherwell.co.uk/courses/

Naples, J. (1971). Existentialism and aesthetic education. *Music Educators Journal, 58*(3), 26-29.

Nelson, S., & Blades, E. (2005). Singing with your whole self: The Feldenkrais method and voice. *Journal of Singing, 62*(2), 145-157.

New England Conservatory (2013). Vocal Pedagogy. Retrieved from http://necmusic.edu/voice-opera

Noddings, N. (2007). *Philosophy of education*. Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

Northwestern University (2013). Vocal Lab. Retrieved from http://www.oto-hns.northwestern.edu/Voice/

Noudelmann, F. (2012). *The philosopher's touch: Sartre, Nietzsche, and Barthes at the piano*. (B. J. Reilly, Trans.). New York: Columbia University Press.

Oberlin College Conservatory (2013). Retrieved from http://new.oberlin.edu/conservatory/

Ohio State University (2013). Vocal Pedagogy. Retrieved from http://music.osu.edu/sites/music.osu.edu/files/MA-Vocal%20Pedagogy.pdf

Otto Schoepfle Vocal Arts Center (2013). Retrieved from http://new.oberlin.edu/conservatory/departments/voice/vocal-arts-center/

Patenaude-Yarnelle, J. (2003). The private studio: A delicate balance: developing an individual approach to the new student. *Journal of Singing, 59*(3), 253-256.

Patenaude-Yarnelle, J. (2004). The most frequent technical problems found in young singers. *Journal of Singing, 60*(5), 491-495.

Patty, A. (1967). Existential teaching. *Educational Theory, 17*(4), 329-334.

Peterson, P. H. (2004). Devising an effective teacher training program for graduate assistants. *Journal of Singing, 61*(2), 155-159.

Princeton University (2013). Department of Music. Retrieved from http://www.princeton.edu/music/index.xml.

Reid, C. (1972). *The free voice*: *A guide to natural singing.* New York: Joseph Patelson Music House.

Ristad, E. (1982). *A soprano on her head: Right-side-up reflections on life and other performances*. Moab, UT: Real People Press.

Robinson, P. (1973). Sartre on music. *The Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism, 31*(4), 451-457.

Rogers, C., & Freiberg, H. J. (1994). *Freedom to learn* (3rd ed.). New York, NY: Macmillan College.

Rogers, C. R. (1976). Carl Rogers and humanistic education. In C. H. Patterson (Ed.), *Foundations for a theory of instruction and educational psychology.* New York: Harper & Row.

Royans School of Vocal Science (2013). Retrieved from http://www.vocalscience.com/

Samoiloff, L. (1942). *The singer's handbook*. Philadelphia: Theodore Presser.

Sanford, S. A. (1995). A comparison of French and Italian singing in the seventeenth century. *Journal of Seventeen-Century Music, 1*(1).

Sartre, J. P. (1960). *Transcendence of the ego.* (F. Williams & R. Kirkpatrick, Trans.). New York: Hill and Wang.

Sartre, J. P. (1965). *Situations*. (B. Eisler, Trans.). New York: George Braziller.

Sartre, J. P. (1984). *Being and nothingness.* (H. E. Barnes, Trans.). New York: Washington Square Press.

Sartre, J. P. (1993). *Essays in existentialism*. W. Baskin (Ed.). New York: Kensington.

Sartre, J. P. (2001). *Jean-Paul Sartre: Basic writings*. S. Priest (Ed.). London: Routledge.

Sartre, J. P. (2007). *Existentialism is a humanism.* (C. Macomber, Trans.) New Haven: Yale University Press.

Sataloff, R. T. (1985) Vocal health. *Opera Digest*, Philadelphia Opera Company, Academy of Music, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania.

Sataloff, R., & Titze, I. (Eds.). (1991). *Vocal health and science. A compilation of articles from the NATS bulletin and the NATS journal*. Jacksonville, FL: National Association of Teachers of Singing.

Sataloff, R. T. (1998). *Vocal health and pedagogy: Science and assessment.* San Diego: Singular Publishing.

Scherer, R., Brewer, D., Colton, R., Rubin, L., Raphael, B., Miller, R., & Moore, P. (1994). The integration of voice science, voice pathology, medicine, public speaking, acting, and singing. *Journal of Voice, 8*(4), 357-374.

Segall, W., & Wilson, A. V. (2004). *Introduction to education: teaching a diverse society*. Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield.

Sell, K. (2005). *The disciplines of vocal pedagogy: Towards an holistic approach*. Burlington: Ashgate.

Shakespeare, W. (1910). *The art of singing*. Bryn Mawr, PA: Oliver Ditson.

Simonson, D. (2012). Recent research in singing. *Journal of Singing, 69*(1), 93-95.

Smith, W. S., & Chipman, M. (2007). *The naked voice: A wholistic approach to singing*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Smithrim, K. (2003), Singing lessons: A hidden pedagogy. *Journal of the Canadian Association for Curriculum Studies, 1*(2), 53-62.

Stark, J. (1999). *Bel canto: A history of vocal pedagogy*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

Striny, D. (2007). *Head first. The language of the head voice: A concise study of learning to sing in the head voice*. Lanham, MD: Hamilton Books.

Striny, D. (2011). *Great singers. An endangered species: How to get back to Mother Nature*. Lanham, MD: Hamilton Books.

Sundberg, J. (1977). The acoustics of the singing voice. *Scientific American, 236*(3), 82-91.

Swift, A. (2006). *Political philosophy. A beginner's guide for students and politicians*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Taylor, D. (1922). *The psychology of singing. A rational method of voice culture based on a scientific analysis of all systems, ancient and modern*. New York: MacMillan.

Teachey, J., Kahane, J., & Beckford, N. (1991). *Journal of Voice, 5*(1), 51-56.

Titze, I. (1994). *Principles of vocal production*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall.

Titze, I. (2011). Voice research and technology. *Journal of Singing, 68*(1), 49-50.

University of Central Florida (2013). Department of Theatre. Retrieved from http://theatre.cah.ucf.edu/

University of Central Oklahoma (2013). Department of Music. Retrieved from http://www.uco.edu/cfad/academics/music/index.asp

University of Colorado (2013). Vocal Pedagogy. Retrieved from http://music.colorado.edu/departments/voice/areas-of-study/vocal-pedagogy/

University of Miami (2013). Vocal Pedagogy. Retrieved from http://www.miami.edu/frost/index.php/ vocal performance/degrees/

University of North Carolina (2013). Vocal Pedagogy. Retrieved from
    http://coaa.uncc.edu/Academics/Department-of-music/

University of North Texas (2013). Vocal Pedagogy. Retrieved from http://music.unt.edu/areas-
    of-study/detail/40

University of Texas, Austin (2013). Vocal Pedagogy. Retrieved from
    http://music.utexas.edu/areas/details.aspx?id=11

University of Toronto (2013). Vocal Pedagogy. Retrieved from
    http://www.music.utoronto.ca/Page2418.aspx

van Manen, M. (1990). *Researching lived experience: Human science for an action sensitive
    pedagogy*. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press.

van Manen, M. (1991). *The tact of teaching: The meaning of pedagogical thoughtfulness*.
    Albany, NY: The State University of New York Press.

Vennard, W. (1967). *Singing. The mechanism and the technic*. New York: Carl Fischer.

Vocal Science™ Method (2013). Retrieved from http://www.vocalscience.com/

Wakefield, G. (2003). Vocal pedagogy and pedagogical voices. *Proceedings of the 2003
    International Conference on Auditory Display*.

Ware, C. (1998). *Basics of vocal pedagogy: The foundations and process of singing*. New York:
    McGraw-Hill.

Webber, J. (2006). Sartre's theory of character. *European Journal of Philosophy, 14*(1), 94-116.

Webster, S. (2002). Existentialism: Providing an ideal framework for educational research in
    times of uncertainty ®*, in AARE 2002 :*Problematic futures: educational research in an era of
    uncertainty; AARE 2002 conference papers, Australian Association for Research in
    Education, Coldstream, Vic. pp. 1-15. Retrieved from
    http://hdl.handle.net/10536/DRO/DU:30033908

Wei, C. T. (2006). *Role and efficacy of verbal imagery in teaching: Case study and computer
    analysis.* Retrieved from ProQuest Digital Dissertations. (UMI 3251829)

Westfall, K. G. (2012). *A model of an effective approach to studio voice at the undergraduate
    level: The vocal method of Dr. Raquel Cortina.* Retrieved from ProQuest Digital
    Dissertations. (UMI 3514730)

Westminster Choir College (2013). Vocal Pedagogy. Retrieved from
    http://www.rider.edu/wcc/academics/graduate-programs/master-music-voice-pedagogy-and-
    performance#pedagogy

Whitlock, W. (1975). *Profiles in vocal pedagogy: A textbook for singing teachers.* Ann Arbor,
    MI: Clifton Press.

Wurgler, P. S. (1997). Voice pedagogy: The process of teaching the art of singing. *Journal of
    Singing, 53*(5), 3-8.

Yanagisawa, E., Estill, J., Kmucha, S., & Leder, S. (1989). The contribution of aryepiglottic
    constriction to "ringing" voice quality. *Journal of Voice, 3*(4), 342-35.

.

---

[i] For this study, I have decided to use the generic third person "she" in most cases to balance the
predominance of the masculine "he", "man," and "mankind" often found in the philosophical
writings reviewed for this research study (Martyna, 1978, 1980; Sartre, 1984, 2007). This is a
common practice for political philosophers (Brighouse & Swift, 2006; Swift, 2006).

[ii] Florid, fast phrases of music.

[iii] Smooth, sustained music passages.

[iv] Reviews of graduate vocal pedagogy programs show that while some institutions have minimal pedagogy courses that are part of degree programs, their focus remaining on the performance aspect. Some students have limited teaching practicum supervision. Course content is based in vocal science, history, and vocal performance.

[v] A number of universities offer vocal pedagogy programs, including:Boston Conservatory, Kansas University, Manhattan School of Music, McGill University, New England Conservatory, Ohio State University, Shenandoah University, University of Colorado, University of Miami, University of North Carolina, University of North Texas, University of Texas, University of Toronto, and Westminster Choir College.

[vi] Pre-service teachers for the purpose of this study are music students in vocal pedagogy degree programs who have not taught outside their academic institutions. Graduates are those who instruct in higher education institutions or private voice studios.

[vii] Vocal Arts Center of Oberlin University,, Westminster Choir College Voice Research Center, Syracuse University, University of Florida, University of Iowa, Northwestern University, University of Arizona and the Denver Center for Performing Arts.

[viii] Mechano-physical is a term that Samoiloff uses to describe an approach based in science and vocal anatomy.

[ix] Acadia University, Boston University, Guildhall School of Music and Drama, The Julliard School, Manhattan School of Music, McGill University, New England Conservatory of Music, University of Toronto and the University of Maryland.

[x] The process in this study is the study of vocal technique and development and what is entailed in vocal study: lessons, practice song preparation, translation, learning notes and performance preparation, for example.